

98

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In
Ministry for the Environment
PO Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

RECEIVED
19 FEB 2009

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz
Fax: 04 439 7705
[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): Ian Samuel Christensen

Postal Address: 366 Millers Line, RD 4, Palmerston North

Work Ph: 06 3542030 Home Ph: 06 3258784 Cell: 021 530132

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email: ianandbud@farmside.co.nz

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are: See attachment

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

Decline the application in its entirety.
See attachment

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): [Signature] Date: 15/02/2009

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.		✓	
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.		✓	
Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 		✓	
Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m³ of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map. 		✓	

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freeport – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatu Mo Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

Submission to Board of Enquiry established by Minister for Environment

Mighty River Power Turitea Wind Farm application, notified 23 January 2009

Name of Submitter:

Ian Christensen

1. I live in our family home at 366 Millricks Line, just below the Te Mata ridgeline of the northern Tararua ranges, about half way between Linton and Tokomaru. I work and undertake leisure time activities in Palmerston North and the wider Manawatū. I have lived on Palmerston North City for the last 20 years.
2. The privilege of establishing our family home and living below the Te Mata ridgeline has given me a strong affinity with and appreciation of the Tararua ranges. I feel the presence of the ranges on a constant daily basis as I live, travel and work in the Manawatū. This is augmented by my recreation activity of running along some of the trails in the region.
3. I am aware of the various moods and changes shown by the ranges during different times of the day, different times of the year and in different weather conditions. I feel that the ranges are an integral part of my life in the Manawatū, and my well being as an individual and the well being of my family.
4. I oppose the application in its entirety for the reasons set out below:
5. The Tararua ranges in the Manawatū region have become saturated with wind turbines. The Turitea wind farm will result in the total consumption of the Tararua range in the vicinity of Palmerston North with wind turbines. This cumulative effect must be considered not only in regard to the existing turbines, but in regard also to turbines consented but not yet built (Moturimu, Te Rere Hau and Tararua).
6. The adverse visual effect will significantly reduce the ability of the local population to be uplifted by and obtain sustenance from this major part of our landscape.
7. The adverse visual effects will become more significant and detrimental the closer one lives, works and plays to the wind farm site. It is a breach of fairness and natural justice that the impact on the amenity values of the people who have established their homes in the vicinity of the wind farm site will be significant. They will live with the constant movement of the wind turbines towering above them. This will be a significant change in the rural and quiet character of the environment that attracted them to establish their homes in the area.
8. The noise generated by the wind farm will further reduce the amenity value of the homes in the vicinity and the ability of the people to enjoy their quiet semi-rural lifestyle. I don't believe that the Noise Standards are rigorous enough to ensure people are not adversely affected by the noise. This is evidenced by the many people

who live in the Ashhurst area surrounded by wind turbines, and whose lives are constantly interrupted by turbine noise in various wind conditions. Submissions by Ashhurst residents to the Turitea wind farm application are testimony to this.

9. I don't believe that New Zealand will gain enough benefit in terms of the electricity generated to offset the costs to the local residents and wider Manawatū community.
10. I am not against using the wind to generate electricity, although believe that there are many questions about its efficacy in contributing to New Zealand's energy needs that are unanswered or glossed over because of a general mindset that wind energy is green and will therefore help save the world from global warming.
11. I believe that it is morally wrong, and against the ethic of stewardship and sustainability to put wind further farms on our Manawatū ridgeline before we put in place rules, regulations, policies and campaigns to ensure that as a society we are more efficient and less wasteful and extravagant in our use of electricity. New homes are not required to have solar water heating. Most homes still use incandescent light bulbs. Many buildings in the central city not in use at night time are left with all their lights on. And so on. The examples of wastefulness and extravagance are many. We would not need so much new generation capacity if we were more efficient and less wasteful in our use of the present electricity generation.
12. A recent study by the Electricity Commission concluded that a targeted campaign could realise savings of 6,437 GWh¹ per year by 2016, that would not have a negative impact on New Zealand's economy. In 2006 all of New Zealand's wind turbines had an installed capacity of 170 MW, and produced 617² GWh of electricity. In other words, potential savings are ten times greater than total wind generation. This highlights how little benefit we get from wind energy in comparison to what we might get from a programme to become more efficient and less wasteful. I do not believe that we should sacrifice the last part of our ridgeline before we do much more to reduce wastefulness and extravagance.
13. The problem is that generation companies and those deriving benefit from generation are really only lukewarm to the idea of being less extravagant and wasteful in our electricity use, except in times of crisis. The bottom line is that selling less power means less income and therefore less profit. We believe that it is morally wrong that this profit is made at the sacrifice of the last part of our mountain, ridgeline and landscape.
14. Exacerbating the relatively small amount of power that wind farms produce is its variability and the difficulty that the national grid has in coping with that variability. Transpower who operate the national grid have recently told us that for the last three years, the wind farms in the Manawatū have operated at less than 1% of capacity

¹ <http://www.electricitycommission.govt.nz/pdfs/opdev/elec-efficiency/potential/Potentials-summary-Oct07.pdf>

² http://www.windenergy.org.nz/FAQ/proj_dom.htm

during winter evenings when demand is at its peak³. During some weeks in autumn 2008, the Te Apiti wind farm produced only one sixth of its installed capacity⁴.

15. The fact that the wind blows sometimes and not others, and you can't catch it and store it for use later on, is the reason that Transpower is saying clearly that we have enough wind farms in the Manawatū, in fact, they recommend no more in the whole of the lower North Island. I quote from Transpower's system operations manager Keiran Devine: "We have real concerns about the large amount of wind generation planned in the lower North Island, because the preliminary information is that they will all have very similar characteristics to the Manawatū farms and that won't help with winter peaks. We'd prefer they were spread around so that when one's up others will be down and it would balance itself out."⁵
16. I am concerned that part of the wind farm is to be built in the Turitea reserve, and the impact the earthworks and associated construction activity will have on Palmerston North's water catchment area.
17. I ask that the Board decline Mighty River Power's application in its entirety.
18. I wish to be heard at the hearing in support of this submission.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'B. Art'.

³ Taranaki Daily News, 11 June, 2008

⁴ Radio New Zealand News, 19 July 2008

⁵ Taranaki Daily News, 11 June, 2008