

# SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In  
Ministry for the Environment  
PO Box 10362  
The Terrace  
Wellington 6143

RECEIVED  
25 FEB 2009

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz  
Fax: 04 439 7705

[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission,  
please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

## CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr (Mrs) Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): HELEN BOLEYN

Postal Address: LOTHLORIEN, R. D. 4, PALMERSTON NORTH

Work Ph: Home Ph: 06 3258668 Cell:

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email:

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are:

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

Wind turbines are far too close to houses; residents' health will suffer and they will be unable to sell and move. The cumulative effect of the wind farm will be a massive eyesore. Destruction of native vegetation, and run-off and silt contamination during construction (and following). There is already an "eco-park"; further "development" is unnecessary. See pages 1 & 2. Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

Please see page 3.

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): *H Boleyn*

Date: 20 Feb 09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Ministry for the  
**Environment**  
Manatu Mo Te Taiao

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.  
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
<b>Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.		✓	
<b>Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits</b>			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.		✓	
<b>Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map</li> <li>for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone</li> <li>for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map.</li> </ul>		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	
<b>Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for land disturbance of more than 200 m<sup>3</sup> of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map</li> <li>for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District</li> <li>for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline)</li> <li>for not meeting noise requirements</li> <li>for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map.</li> </ul>		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freepost – MRP  
Mighty River Power Ltd  
PO Box 445  
Hamilton 3240  
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email [turitea@mightyriver.co.nz](mailto:turitea@mightyriver.co.nz) or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.

1

### Environment and Damage to Water Supply

Maps provided do not show the rivers or dams, but looking at a contour map one can see that silt and runoff will naturally arrive in the waterways. Mighty River Power no doubt promises to see that this does not occur, but in the light of recent unexpected flooding (Tuesday 17<sup>th</sup> February 2009) in Palmerston North during heavy rain, it is obvious that plans can be washed away. We are experiencing more and more weather 'events' that are unusual, and for which previous contingencies are inadequate. Turitea is a high rainfall area and it is certain that this problem will arise.

For many decades the Turitea area has been out of bounds to trampers, picnickers, and indeed anyone but those officially sanctioned to check on the water supply of the city. All this has been to ensure that our supply of fresh clean water remained uncontaminated. At a time when there are more people relying on the water than ever, and more contaminants arriving on our shores and needing to be excluded from water supplies, it makes no sense to expose the city's water to a major source of pollutants.

The amount of bush that will need to be stripped from the area in order to create access roads, turbine platforms etc varies with reports, but it is clear that a considerable area will be removed. This is indigenous vegetation that struggles to grow in a windswept area, and is many years old. It cannot be replaced. It forms an 'eco park' – we have no need of some 'landscaped' replacement.

It appears that Mighty River Power has made no plans for removal of turbines after their 'useful' life is over, so that abandoned turbines and concrete platforms may be left as eyesores for centuries unless the city takes responsibility for this.

2

### Sound and Health

Noise from wind turbines can affect the health of people living nearby. Although some turbines have been removed from Mighty River Power's original plans, others remain unacceptably close to housing. In easterly winds, which are more frequent of late, wind turbines create noise that is irritating and impossible to ignore. In conditions of temperature inversion, which often occur in winter, and also at other times of year, sound is amplified and driven downwards. Turbines above gullies will, under these conditions, make sound that carries considerable distances.

Overseas studies (particularly those by doctors – Nina Pierpont, Amanda Harry, Prof. M. Alves-Pereira) have identified wind turbine noise as causing a variety of symptoms from heart problems to nervous and digestive upsets. These doctors have had no interest in wind farms, but have become concerned at the sufferings of their patients, and have investigated the causes. Details are available from websites, notably that of Dr Nina Pierpont.

Having worked with children who have learning difficulties arising from various causes, I am very aware that there are large numbers of children who have problems with concentration. Many are unusually sensitive to noise, which can upset their sleep patterns and digestion as well as their ability to concentrate. Families who have children thus affected often live in areas out of the city, where traffic noise does not disturb them and

there is generally greater peace and quiet. Turitea and Kahuterawa have been chosen for this reason; now it seems the peace may be ruined by the continual noise of wind turbines. The two valleys are likely to become sounding-boxes in easterly wind or temperature inversion conditions.

Sleepless nights are reported by numbers of people living near wind farms. In many cases they were assured by the companies who erected the turbines that there would be no noise, or negligible or very occasional noise, only to find that the noise was continual and unbearable. The Davis family in Wales has been driven from their home, and there are many other cases discussed via internet channels – see [www.wind-watch.org/news](http://www.wind-watch.org/news).

3

### Visual Effects

The skyline seen from many parts of Palmerston North is already crowded with wind turbines of various sizes and types. There are so many that they have long ceased to be an interesting or beautiful sight, and it is difficult to notice the contours of the land without being distracted by the turbines covering the area. The cumulative effect is too great now, and with the addition of the proposed Turitea wind farm will be overwhelming.

For those living close to the turbines there will be no visual respite, and some properties will be subjected to flicker problems as sun and moon rise behind the turbines.

The destruction of native vegetation would be appalling. The roadways necessary for transporting turbine components would bare the ridges where bush is slowly regenerating and make a large, outstanding eyesore. Not a "green" effect.

\*\*

I seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry:

That the building of Turitea Wind Farm be declined.

Failing this, that it be –

(1) Limited to areas outside the Turitea Reserve, and that wind turbines be placed only where it would be impossible for their construction to cause any contamination of city water supplies by silt, or any other material, or the runoff of rainwater from such.

(2) Also that no turbine be placed closer than TWO kilometres from any residence.

(3) Also that Mighty River Power be required to make provision for de-commissioning turbines when their useful life is over; this to involve removal and disposal of all components, and restoration of platform and roading areas to a level to be agreed with the City Council.