

500

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In
Ministry for the Environment
PO Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

OR

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz

Fax: 04 439 7705

[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']



This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): Elizabeth Anne Endres

Postal Address: 28 Moonshine Valley Rd., R-D.1, Palmerston North.

Work Ph: 06 3508143 Home Ph: 3546989 Cell: 0210318688

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email: liz.endres@gmail.com

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).
Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are: If you are attaching further information tick for yes

Please see attached letter.

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

Please DECLINE this application.

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): *E. Endres*

Date: 18/2/09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR
My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.		✓	
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.		✓	
Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	
Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m³ of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map. 		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freeport – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

ELIZABETH ENDRES

28 Moonshine Valley Rd.,
R.D. 1,
Aokautere,
PALMERSTON NORTH

Phone (06) 354 6989

liz.endres@gmail.com

18 February 2009

Turitea Call In
Ministry for the Environment
P.O. Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

Submission on Mighty River Power Ltd
Applications for Resource Consent.

The Board of Inquiry,
Dear Sirs and Madam,

Hi, my name is Liz Endres. I was born in Palmerston North and have lived in the region all my life. I was brought up on a stud and mixed stock farm in Longburn where I learned to appreciate and look after the land and environment. I also lived on a 25 acre block on Richardsons Line in the airport area where stock were reared and a native plant nursery was established until this area was rezoned Industrial by the Palmerston North City Council in 2001. I now live on a ¾ acre property on Moonshine Valley Road, Aokautere which was purchased by the Santa Rosa Trust in 2002. I have 2 children, Amanda whom is a Food Technologist working in Melbourne, and Robert who is a building apprentice in Palmerston North. I live with my dog Gus and cat Morris. I am a Radiation Therapist working for MidCentral Health, and am a treatment machine supervisor. I work 40 hours per week and spend the majority of my time off in Moonshine Valley and the surrounding vicinity. I am fortunate enough to view the ranges daily both on my travel to and fro the hospital, at the hospital "Lookout" cafeteria, and when walking Gus most evenings down my road. I also walk the local tracks numerous weekends, the Gorge Track, the Sledge Track which leads into Hardings Park, and less often the Coppermine Creek Track at Woodville. So for me the Ruahine and Tararua Ranges play a very significant part of my life and my enjoyment and appreciation of it. I therefore strongly oppose Mighty River Powers applications for consent in its entirety. My specific concerns regarding Mighty River Powers application for consent for a 122 turbine wind farm at Turitea are:

Visual prominence and including the cumulative visual effect and the significance of the Ruahine and Tararua Ranges to Palmerston North and surrounds.
Ecological protection of the Turitea Reserve
Preservation of the "Reserve"
Water Quality
Noise

Visual Prominence and Cumulative Effect and Significance of the Tararua and Ruahine Ranges

Palmerston North and surrounds is situated in a large area of plains, thus the most outstanding feature of the landscape is the Ruahine and Tararua Range which extends the full length of the region. The ranges are clearly visible from Palmerston North and much of the surrounding region. The proposed Turitea Windfarm site is in what you could describe the prime area of the Ranges due to its close proximity to the city and its high visibility. Therefore I believe the proposed Turitea site is situated in a prominent and significant location and should remain unencumbered with turbines. The close proximity of the site to the city would make the proposed turbines overwhelmingly visible and would seriously detract from our picturesque views and unique character which is Manawatu.

Palmerston North is unique in being the only urban area with significant aggregation of turbines on its boundaries. We already have 200 turbines situated along the Ranges from Ashhurst/Woodville right through to Tokomaru. There are a further 140 turbines consented but yet to be constructed which will bring the total up to 340 turbines at Te Apiti, Tararua, Te Rere Hau, and Motorimu. This is indeed a very large number of turbines which are highly visible from a large area of the Manawatu. It is a significant contribution for one area to make toward national energy generation from renewable energy without the addition of the proposed Turitea turbines. This would then total 462 turbines and would have the effect of totally saturating our landscape with turbines since it would fill in the turbine free zone between Te Rere Hau and Motorimu wind farms. I strongly believe this area between Te Rere Hau and Motorimu wind farms should remain free of any turbines to maintain some of our unique and original character pre wind farms and Mighty River Power's application should therefore be declined.

Ecological Protection of Turitea Reserve

Mighty River Power have applied for consent to construct 66 turbines within the Turitea Reserve, an idea I find totally unacceptable. It is the right of every New Zealander to access a local native flora and fauna reserve to enjoy the natural beauty, unspoilt views, peaceful sounds and surrounds of local bird and insect life as well as flowing streams. Basically the sight, sound, and smell of the way nature intended our region before man and machinery arrived. These areas must be maintained for future generations of kiwis to enjoy in their natural state. Historically Palmerston North has been a poor guardian of this Turitea Reserve, allowing firstly possums then deer to be introduced here much to the detriment of the reserve. This has directly resulted in the decline of the substantial specimen trees from possum damage followed then by wind damage caused by the opening up of the canopy from the defoliation of these once magnificent and proud specimens. Turitea is only just now recovering from this destruction with the building up of some rare and endangered species which is occurring. We cannot allow this reserve to be again placed under severe threat of destruction from construction of access roads and turbines. We as Palmerstonians, the guardians, must preserve, nurture and protect Turitea. The presence of turbines at Te Apiti close to the Gorge Walkway has made this a far less attractive walk with the noise through part of the walk from the turbines completely overpowering any bird or bush sounds and the sight of these huge structures overwhelming previously magnificent bush lookouts. The need to create roads to turbines along windy ridges is a recipe for destruction of the unique flora which exists on these inhospitable ridges. They are delicate ecosystems which have arisen here and they rely strongly on the close proximity of other like bush and shrubs for their very survival. By introducing roads a wind tunnel effect is created and die back occurs due to exposure to the wind. This die back extends further and further as more wind is introduced. A number of these turbine sites have rare and threatened species re establishing on them and will surely perish forever should this proposal go ahead. Relocation of bush as proposed will not ever be successful in a location such as this with high wind velocities to contend with. Re establishing areas of bush here is totally unrealistic. Once these threatened species are gone they are gone forever, let us look after them now.

Preservation of the "Reserve"

I strongly believe that Turitea Reserve should remain a Reserve for us and future generations for the preservation and protection of local flora and fauna. This should never be compromised. It should also be accessible for everyone for recreation, relaxation, and enjoyment in its natural state without encumbrances from turbines or any other commercial enterprise. The Mighty River Power Windfarm is in actual fact a commercial enterprise and is for financial gain, not even to the benefit of Palmerston North, however admirable the cause of renewable energy may be. Therefore Turitea must remain a Reserve and Mighty River Powers application should be declined.

Water Quality

I am also concerned about the sedimentation which will occur with the amount of construction required to establish the proposed wind farm. An area equivalent to 123 hectares needs to be cleared which must have a significant effect with runoff going into streambeds and into the reservoir which provides our fair city with water. This must adversely affect the quality of water.

Finally, I would like to thank the Board of Inquiry for reading my submission and wish you well in your decision making process. I would like the Board of Inquiry to decline the Mighty River Power Application for a wind farm at Turitea completely.

Thanking you,

Sincerely,

E. A. Endres

