

(387)

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In
Ministry for the Environment
PO Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

OR

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz

Fax: 04 439 7705

[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']

RECEIVED
23 FEB 2009

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: DR Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): SUSAN PARKER

Postal Address: 374 MILLRICKS LINE, RD 4, P/U

Work Ph: Home Ph: Cell: 021 181 9037

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email:

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are:

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

ATTACHED

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

DECLINE ENTIRE APPLICATION

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): Susan M Parker

Date: 17/2/09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents

104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.			
---	--	--	--

104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.			
--	--	--	--

Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits

104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
--	--	--	--

104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.			
--	--	--	--

104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
--	--	--	--

104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
--	--	--	--

104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.			
---	--	--	--

104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.			
--	--	--	--

Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents

<p>RC0068:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 			
--	--	--	--

Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents

<p>1448:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m³ of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map. 			
---	--	--	--

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freeport – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

Submission Against The Proposed Turitea Wind Farm.

*Susan M Parker
374 Millricks Line
Linton
021 1819037*

Background

I am privileged to live in the foothills of the Tararuas these last 15 years. I have chosen to live in these hills as they are beautiful and peaceful; to me they are living - they are constantly changing, every day the shadows and the light are different. However the whole character of these hills is under threat by the slowly encroaching wind turbines and any new applications should be declined. My property is less than 4kms from the proposed Turitea wind farm.

Since I have been researching wind farms I have read of the misery they cause, the destruction of the environment they are responsible for, and realized the negligible effect they have on reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Consequently I have graduated from a NIMBY to a NIABY... not in *anybody's* backyard!

Visual impact

The Tararua ridgeline and foothills are an iconic landscape to the Manawatu... yet the PNCC has not seen fit to recognise the small finite area within the city boundary. It is an area of natural beauty with spectacular views, the only area of its type in the city..... The hills also have recreational significance - my children and I have walked on the ridges, camped there, ridden our horses there... once this area is despoiled it is gone for all future generations. At what point do we say 'enough is enough!' ?

Unlike the PNCC and Horizons, the Horowhenua District Council has accepted its responsibilities under the Local Government Act of 2002 and has recognised the significance of the Tararua mountain range as well as the adverse effect of wind turbines on the community and environment.

In their submission opposing the Motorimu wind farm they have stated:

"The value of landscape can not be overstated. The Tararua ridgeline and ranges are an integral part of the Horowhenua communities and the backdrop against which the people of Horowhenua live their lives. The ranges are a highly visible and defining part of the district. The environmental and visual impact of wind turbines on this landscape would be immense."

They have made a stand against permitting any turbines on the ridgeline.

No doubt it will be argued that the landscape is already ruined and one more wind farm will make no difference in a ruined environment. However I hope the detrimental cumulative effect of all the already consented wind farms will be considered and that this Court will decide that "enough is enough" and that what will be lost for our region, especially the loss of character of the Turitea Reserve, is far more important than supplying a tiny amount of energy to the national grid that will be used in Auckland.

Noise

As wind farms have proliferated, more and more complaints are being made about the adverse noise effects upon many neighbours up to a distance of 10kms. Although below the acceptable NZ noise standard, noise from turbines is experienced as an insidious 'beat' that has proved detrimental to the health and well-being of many neighbours, as well as preventing normal use and enjoyment of their property.

Property devaluation

This is a well known product of wind farms. An Australian Federal Minister has denounced wind farms as a 'complete fraud'. He states 'they destroy the land and to see hardworking individuals have their properties

devalued so considerably is immoral'

Clustering of windmills in the Manawatu

Nearly 80% of all NZ wind power is generated in the Manawatu .

As well as the environmental destruction and extreme visual effects the cluster of existing wind farms in the northern Tararua ranges causes problems for the national grid operator, Transpower. A report from the Department of Economic Development notes that large swings in generation output with the prevailing local winds even from the presently approved wind farms in the Manawatu will be a problem and the grid will have to be upgraded. They recommend that wind farms be more geographically dispersed throughout the country to even out the magnitude of these large swings in generation and allow a higher level of integration of wind generated energy.

The PNCC presently has no guidelines.

The parliamentary Commissioner for the Environment states in 'Wind power, place and people' :

*'Cumulative effects of multiple wind farms on the Tararua ranges are becoming a concern. Existing wind farms on the Tararua Ranges have formed the baseline for assessing landscape character. Additional wind farms are then assessed against a 'compromised' environment and more likely found to be acceptable. Determining the threshold beyond which multiple wind farms create unacceptable adverse effects in a particular location, district or region is an important step needed at an early stage' .*In my humble opinion this threshold has been reached long ago.

Divisions within the community

In the past entire communities have been split. While I have a certain amount of sympathy for the farmers who sell out their neighbours for large amounts of money, I cannot understand how they can put in submissions in favour of the project for various apparent altruistic reasons without even mentioning these huge payments. With the increase in numbers of wind farms it is becoming more obvious that local residents are faced with the cost in terms of decreased property values and other adverse effects while others (developers, a few landowners, society at large) reap the benefits.

Greenhouse gas emissions and Kyoto Protocol

'...it may be argued that the environmental and social cost of the development of wind energy is out of proportion to any benefit in the form of reduced emission. The industrialization of our least developed landscapes, irreversible ecological damage, loss of amenity and the social division of communities is too high a price for an insignificant and unreliable contribution to our energy supply and a small and uncertain saving of pollution.'

There is a great deal of fervour in support of the Kyoto protocol in New Zealand and so much is written concerning the 'saving' of green house gas emissions by renewable energy projects. The saving in these emissions is considered a major emotive factor in favour of wind energy and is always mentioned by the developer and the government in applications.

It is often said that wind energy will replace the need for future coal fired plants and consequently save large amounts of fossil fuel emissions. This may be the case if our coal is left in the ground..... However, if we do not build a coal fired plant here in New Zealand we will export the coal to another country (one of the developing countries who know that signing up to Kyoto is against their interests) who will burn it there..... There will be NO overall savings of greenhouse gas emissions.

This seems to me to be rather hypocritical of NZ - to export coal and not care what others do with it once it has left our shores. We even give the exporter, Solid Energy, an Export Award for record coal exports!! Surely we can recognize that greenhouse gas emission is a global problem and we all live on the same planet.

In NZ approximately 50% of our green house gas emissions are generated as methane by belching cows.

'Increasingly large herds of cattle worldwide are singled out as the top culprit causing climate change, deforestation, land degradation, water and air pollution, water shortage and loss of biodiversity'. They produce more emissions than the entire transport industry. So what are we doing about this in New Zealand now? Farmers have a lot of clout in this country so it is unlikely we will ever do very much.

The fastest growth area in the transport sector is air travel. This is recognised by the 'green miles' concept which is another trade barrier we will have to overcome by demonstrating our efficiencies of production. It is interesting that the Turitea project says it has the potential to generate enough wind energy to power approximately 150,000 homes and save large amounts of CO2 emissions when compared to thermally generated energy. To put this into perspective the CO2 emissions saved by this proposed wind farm is less than that generated by one daily 747 flight from NZ to London.

Even the Australian Minister of Agriculture is on record stating that *'the wind farms will diminish greenhouse gas emissions by so small an amount I doubt you could calculate it . They are simply an excuse for some entrepreneurs to make money at the expense of taxpayers and adjoining landowners'*.

Along with many others, I believe the much touted 'green' image of the wind turbines is a 'convenient lie' instigated by developers and any saving on green house gas emissions is negligible in the greater scheme of things. It is a red herring pushed by our government to divert attention from the major (unpopular) areas that we really should be addressing, ie emissions from animal and traffic sources. It also tends to distract us from the encroaching destruction of our beautiful natural landscapes by these huge alien monsters that are becoming all too common now throughout the world.

Alternatives

One of the major problems with all the Tararua wind farms is that the windmills are situated too close to houses. The hills form a backdrop to our communities and the landscape is part of our way of life.

There are many more suitable areas for wind farms in this country that are relatively isolated. Those of us who have chosen to live in the Tararuas around Palmerston North have spent our lives working to earn the right to move away from the noise and bustle of the city to the peace and quiet of the hills in our retirement years.

Please do not rush in with haste to destroy our beautiful countryside and reserves with wind farms, at least until the government has taken the time to investigate the downside and develop guidelines to protect the people. Wind farms are notoriously inefficient and expensive compared with hydro. Other forms of renewable energy are now under investigation and becoming cheaper all the time..... tidal, wave, and solar energy to mention a few. (unfortunately one does not dare mention 'nuclear' in this country).

It has been pointed out that if we practise conservation we could save the output of three power plants. At present there is no encouragement to do this.

National Guidelines Required

At this point in time the NZ Government is pushing wind farms as a source of renewable energy but gives no guidelines on suitable areas to put them or on the allowable distances from dwellings. They have not recognised the vast amount of evidence that is now available on the effects of repetitive sound and vibration on neighbours but are rushing in with submissions in favour of all wind projects willy nilly. They even require local bodies to disregard their mandate under the Local Government Act of 2002 and consider the perceived 'national good' above any detrimental effect on the local community and environment that they should be protecting. As more and more wind farms are being constructed these effects are being felt by more and more people and their health as well as the environment is suffering.

Windmills are now the most hated eyesore in the UK .

In Conclusion

Due to extreme detrimental visual and environmental effects I respectfully ask you to decline this application.