

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In
Ministry for the Environment
PO Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

OR

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz

Fax: 04 439 7705

[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: "Turitea Call in"]

RECEIVED
23 FEB 2009

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

Our Full Name(s): SUSAN MARY CASSELLS

Postal Address: 562 TURITEA RD RD4 PALMERSTON NORTH.

Work Ph: (06) 350 5799 Home Ph: (06) 354 7701 Cell: 021 354 775

Work Fax: (06) 350 5651 Home Fax: Email: S.M.cassells@massey.ac.nz

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are: If you are attaching further information tick for yes

Please see attached submission.

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

See attached submission

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): *S.M. Cassells*

Date: 21/02/09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.		✓	
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.			✓
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.			✓
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.		✓	
Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	✓ ✓
Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m³ of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map. 		✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓ ✓	

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freepost – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Mātauranga Mō Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

**SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD
APPLICATION FOR RESOURCE CONSENT FOR THE PROPOSED TURITEA
WIND FARM**

To: Ministry for the Environment

From: Susan Mary Cassells
562 Turitea Road
RD 4
Palmerston North

Introduction

We bought our 6.1ha property in the Turitea Valley (562 Turitea Road, Lot 2, DP 80696, Blk III, Arawaru SD) in 1996. In the valley the property is unique in its views and its peacefulness and its sense of remoteness. The views are spectacular: the ruggedness of the Turitea Gorge in the foreground, Mt Ruapehu to the north, the Ruahine Range to the north east, the Tararua foothills to the south, and the beautiful indigenous forest of the Turitea Reserve to the south east. Our property is covered in both pine and regenerating indigenous forest as is the eastern side of the valley opposite us, so that visitors always comment on the feeling of remoteness and the ruggedness of the view, while being so close to the city. I spent much of my earlier childhood at Bealey Spur, near Arthur's Pass, so for me this is priceless.

We knew when we bought here that it was highly unlikely that we would get many, if any houses built within our immediate view and we had the Turitea Reserve on our doorstep so we thought the views and the sense of remoteness would stay. It never occurred to me that there would ever be a proposal to change the designation of the reserve in order to accommodate wind turbines within the reserve.

My concerns (the reasons for this submission):

1. Visual Impact

My greatest concern is the visual impact of wind turbines some of which will totally dominate our views. The proposed turbines are so close and intrusive that we will lose the views and the sense of peace and remoteness that drew us to this property in the first place and that for us gives the property its greatest value.

Mighty River Power acknowledges that turbines closer than 1.5km will *"be highly visible and will usually dominate the landscape"* and turbines 1.5 to 3.5km *"will be potentially noticeable and can dominate the landscape"* (ERMA, 2008). Interestingly Mighty River Power has decided to remove from the proposal the three turbines closest to our house, the closest of which was to be within 635m of our dwelling, but have left 13 turbines within 2km of our house in the proposal. There are more than 38 turbines within 3.5 km of our house and of these, at least 29 will be highly visible.

2. Noise

Also of concern is noise, particularly low frequency noise. According to the Hegley Acoustic Consultants Report (#7720) commissioned by MRP, which contains a noise contour envelope map (Figure 43, Hegley 2008), our property is located within the 40 dBA noise zone. The proposal has 13 turbines within 2km of our house so I have

serious concerns that we may be worn down by the noise and that our sleep may be disturbed.

3. Strobe Effect

Turbines 075, 076, 077, 078, 082, 083, 084 and 085 are located between our house and the rising sun and moon. The moon and sun rise over the ridge immediately across the valley to the east of our house. I have concern that there is the potential for these turbines to cause a strobe effect. I am very prone to migraine headaches and am particularly sensitive to light where migraines are concerned. In the past these have been triggered by the flickering effect in situations such as driving alongside back-lit trees.

4. Turbines in the Turitea Reserve

I am opposed to all wind turbines in the Turitea Reserve. It is highly likely that with turbines in the reserve we will not see the protection of the scenic, historic, archaeological, biological, and natural features of the reserve. The skyline is the dominant landscape characteristic and it will be lost to the clutter of twirling wind turbines.

Conclusion

Many turbines of the proposed Turitea Wind Farm will have a detrimental impact on our ability to enjoy our property and are also likely to decrease the value of our property. Specific turbines will completely dominate our viewshed, and we will lose the amenity value of our property which we hold dear. I am worried about the potential strobe effect of turbines that are close to our property, and we are concerned about potential noise from the wind farm and the effect this may have on our health.

To alleviate our concerns over the wind farm I request that consent be denied for the construction of the following wind turbines:

057, 058, 059, 060, 061, 062, 063, 064, 065, 066, 075, 076, 077, 078, 082, 083, 084, 085, 086, 087, 088, 127, 128, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133

In addition I am opposed to all wind turbines in Turitea Reserve and request that consent be denied for the construction of those turbines to be situated in the Reserve.

Thank you for the opportunity to make this submission.

Yours faithfully



Sue Cassells

References

Environmental Resources Management Australia. 2008.

'Turitea Wind Farm. Assessment of Environmental Effects – Landscape & Visual Assessment.' *Turitea Wind Farm. Resource Consent Applications and Assessment of Environmental Effects.* Mighty River Power. Auckland.

Hegley Acoustic Consultants. 2008.

'Proposed Wind Farm. Turitea. Assessment of Noise Effects. Report No. 7720.' *Turitea Wind Farm. Resource Consent Applications and Assessment of Environmental Effects.* Mighty River Power. Auckland.