

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In OR Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz
Ministry for the Environment Fax: 04 439 7705
PO Box 10362 [Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission,
The Terrace please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']
Wellington 6143

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): **Kevin William Low**

Postal Address: **107 Ngahere Park Road, PALMERSTON NORTH**

Work Ph: **06 357 1435**

Home Ph:

Cell: **027 448 5826**

Work Fax: **06 357 1438**

Home Fax:

Email: kevin@ideation.co.nz

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are:

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

I am a person who has an interest in the proceedings that is greater than the public generally in that my home is less than 1.5 kms from proposed turbines and in a direct line of sight with the ranges proposed to be part of the windfarm.

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

I respectfully request the Board of Inquiry to decline the application from Mighty River Power in its entirety.

That should the entire application not be declined, that construction of turbines 088, 087, 086, 085, 084, 083, 082, 074, 075, 076, 077, 078 whose noise envelope and landscape amenity seriously encroach on my living conditions and health and wellbeing be declined.

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s):



Date:

Kevin Low

28th January 2009

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.			
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.			
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.			
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.			
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.			
Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 			
Taranui District Council – Land-use Consents			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Taranui District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m² of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Taranui District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Taranui District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Taranui Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Taranui District as generally shown on the included map. 			

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freepost – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

Supporting information to my submission.

My name is Kevin Low and my dwelling is at 107 Ngahere Park Road in the Turitea Valley. The dwelling is sited on a knoll and across a gully from Bryant Hill. The terrain slopes steeply downward some 10 metres from the house giving me unrestricted views of Bryant Hill with no option to use vegetation as a shield.

My dwelling is seven years old and two storied, with one bedroom and living rooms downstairs and other bedrooms and an office upstairs. The style is modern with floor to ceiling windows and doors (literally) in many rooms. The house faces north-north-east, giving us an uninterrupted view along the Tararua Ranges and well into the Ruahine range.

While sitting on my couch in the living room I can currently see some 67 turbines from three different wind farms. Each windfarm has a different model of turbine which rotates at differing speeds. Sometimes the current view has a frenetic look to it, particularly when later afternoon sun accentuates the contrast or even reflects sunlight as it rotates. I tend not to look at the view during these conditions.

I work from my dwelling – from an upstairs office, also with an expansive view of both the Tararua and Ruahine ranges. Again, I have learned to choose my times to enjoy the natural serenity of the ranges.

I am aware that there are a further 64 consented turbines to be built that will be in my viewpoint.

Notwithstanding my situation, I have not been anti-windfarms. I have friends much closer who report health-related impacts, but, at 6 kilometres from the closest turbine, I feel luckier than they.

As an affected person, I was notified when the use-change application for the Turitea Reserve was lodged in 2006. I spent several days educating myself on the issues and finally submitted in favour of the use-change. Before submitting in this way, I;

- Studied the management plan of the reserve and as much printed documentation, including maps, which the Palmerston North City Council gave out on the matter.
- Took advantage of a public site visit organised by PNCC in conjunction with Army to view the Reserve and the ridgeline that was proposed for turbines.
- Questioned Council officers in detail (particularly one Mr Chris Pepper) about the extent and layout of the windfarm being proposed.

The result was that I was left in no doubt that the turbines being proposed at this time would pose no more threat to my visual amenity than those already consented at that time.

When the MRP application was lodged, I was horrified to find that multiple turbines were proposed some 1 kilometre from my dwelling, in a location that I knew from my experience would pose significant health risks to me, both from a removal of visual amenity – my enjoyment of views of the ranges, sleep disturbance from noise, and a destruction of the

rural character of my surroundings. In addition, I felt deceived by council officers who had distorted facts to ensure I supported the use-change of the Turitea Reserve RMA process.

My view of the Mighty River Power application is that it crosses all bounds of sensible planning in proposing such a large windfarm so close to a major provincial city.

My major concern is the 12 (remaining) turbines in the Bryant Hill west cluster which are between 1.4 and 2.2 kilometres from my dwelling. From 4 rooms in my dwelling I will have a clear view of all turbines which will dominate the landscape. I have prepared the photomontage below from data MRP supplied in their application.



There are 16 turbines in this view – 4 distant ones are from the Bryant Hill East cluster.

This view is representative of window views from 5 rooms inside my dwelling. The current view from three rooms is shown below and the same foothill as depicted above can be seen.



I have very great concerns that these turbines will have adverse and significant impacts on my life.

- The rural character that I chose to live in will be destroyed
- The turbines are highly intrusive and will severely impact my enjoyment of my environment
- The turbines are unacceptably dominant from many parts of my property and inside my dwelling.
- The turbines are so close that I am likely to be awakened by the noise during some weather conditions (I sleep on the east side of the house).
- The turbines are so close that I am likely to experience flicker effects as the sun is rising behind the turbines.

In addition to the turbines in close proximity to my dwelling, I also wish to object to turbines on the Turitea Reserve and water catchment area for the following reasons;-

- I believe a rural reserve is not a proper place to site industrial activity
- I have accessed the reserve around the water treatment plant as often as permitted – most recently some 4 months ago. I was awestruck with the fragility of the tundra and the beauty of the undisturbed bush. I sincerely hope the Board members get to see this beautiful spot.

- The reserve, where 57 hectares of native bush will be cleared and 68,000 truckloads of soil will be moved, is currently home to native flora and fauna, the impact on which will be more than minor.
- The reserve, where 57 hectares of native bush will be cleared and 68,000 truckloads of soil will be moved, is the major source of water supply for the City of Palmerston North. It is not credible that the proposed level of construction will have no affect on a vital resource for this community.

In addition, I also wish to object to the sheer scale of covering 35 kilometres of ridgeline with turbines. My view as I drive around Palmerston North and return home will be filled with the presence of a continuous line of nearly 500 turbines visible throughout the Manawatu plains – home to 100,000 people. I do not wish to live in or around the level of industrial activity that nearly 500 turbines represent. Frankly I think I have done my bit to help meet sustainable energy targets and mitigate global climate change.

I seek you to decline the application in its entirety,

Kevin Low
107 Ngahere Park Road