

267

# SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In  
 Ministry for the Environment  
 PO Box 10362  
 The Terrace  
 Wellington 6143

**RECEIVED**  
 23 FEB 2009

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz  
 Fax: 04 439 7705  
 [Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

### CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Dr. Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): JOHN KOOLAARD

Postal Address: 323 PAHIATUA - ADKAUTERE RD

Work Ph: 06 3518249 Home Ph: Cell:

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email: Kool@xnet.co.nz

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are: If you are attaching further information tick for yes

These are contained in the attached document

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

Not approve resource consent for the Turitea Wind Farm application.

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): J.P. Koolaard Date: 23/2/09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.  
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
<b>Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.			
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.			
<b>Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits</b>			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.			
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.			
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.			
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.			
<b>Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map</li> <li>for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone</li> <li>for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map.</li> </ul>			
<b>Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents</b>			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for land disturbance of more than 200 m<sup>3</sup> of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map</li> <li>for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map</li> <li>for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District</li> <li>for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline)</li> <li>for not meeting noise requirements</li> <li>for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map.</li> </ul>			

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freeport – MRP  
Mighty River Power Ltd  
PO Box 445  
Hamilton 3240  
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the  
**Environment**  
Māori Mō Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

---

## **John Koolaard - Submission on the proposed Turitea windfarm**

### **About me, and my family**

My name is John Koolaard and I am a scientist at AgResearch, Palmerston North. I live at 323 Pahiatua-Aokautere Rd, which is about two kilometres from the nearest giant wind turbine of this proposed windfarm. I live here with my wife and our six children who range in age from 16 to 1 years and enjoy doing things together. We are a close-knit family, and the younger children are educated at home.

In 2004 we built a simple house on a 1.5 acre lot along the Pahiatua-Aokautere Rd. We have a small stream running through the property, and that of our nearest neighbours. The area around the stream serves as a playground for some of our younger children, who enjoy climbing the large macrocarpa trees growing on the banks, and wading in the stream to look for small fish or eels.

My wife and I have spent a great deal of energy planting most of our property in native shrubs and trees, to screen our house and property from the road, and to make an attractive garden around the house. We have planted a large vegetable garden and many fruit trees, because we enjoy eating the produce we grow ourselves.

Over the last four years we have carted countless dozens of trailer-loads of mulch, soil, rocks, compost, and landscaping timber onto the property to enhance the garden. Virtually all the work has been done with pick, shovel and spade.

We love our valley, and the trees are growing wonderfully well. It is quiet at night, with the only sounds being the call of our resident morepork, the gurgle of the stream, and the occasional car on the road.

I cycle the 9.2 km to work most days along the narrow carriageway of the Pahiatua-Aokautere Rd, and from the top of Polson Hill I enjoy the exercise and fresh air and the views of the Central Plateau mountains, and our own Tararua ranges. The best views of the ranges are from the top of Summerhill Drive, where the ranges behind the Turitea and Kahuterawa valleys form a striking backdrop. To think that these hills will be covered with giant wind turbines makes me cringe.

When travelling home from work, my eyes are drawn to Whariti peak and the ranges south of the Manawatu Gorge, which are already covered with wind turbines, some of the newer Tararua T3 turbines being grotesquely oversized. It horrifies me that the proposed turbines would be even larger than the biggest existing ones.

On the way up the Pahiatua-Aokautere Road towards our home, our valley stretches up to two prominent hills. On the left one is being built part of the Te Rere Hau windfarm with its gawky two-bladed machines. The hill straight ahead at the end of our valley is

proposed to have turbine numbers 0094, 0068, 0069, 0070 and possibly others on it, and these will loom up over the end of our valley like steel sentries.

I understand that New Zealand should invest more in renewable sources of energy, and has to increase its proportion of energy that comes from these sources, but there must be a balance between this and impacting on communities.

**My main areas of concern** regarding this proposed Turitea windfarm are:

1. The noise from the blades, and also the low frequency vibrations from huge turbines, given our proximity to them. The Southerly quarter winds will bring the sound of the industrial park down our valley to our place and further, following the contours of the land. The lower frequency sounds travel through the ground irrespective of the wind direction.
2. The visual effects of so many giant structures covering the Tararua Ranges. They will dominate every view of the Tararua ranges from anywhere in and around Palmerston North. The cumulative visual effect of so many turbines, stretching for more than 30km from the Saddle Rd to Kahuterawa Valley and Linton, is very significant for me. Several turbines will be visible from our property as we look up the valley at our only view of the ranges from our home in the valley.
3. Increased traffic volume on the Pahiatua-Aokautere Rd. The construction traffic for the proposed windfarm will mostly travel along the Pahiatua-Aokautere Rd past our house. This will be disruptive for our family and if it continues during the nights, will seriously impact on our quality of sleep. Increased traffic will also make the road more dangerous for myself and my children cycling because of the increased traffic volume and traffic speed. Furthermore, if there are considerable numbers of heavy vehicles on the road, this will increase the frustration levels of drivers wanting to overtake, and this poses increased danger for cyclists too.
4. The noise and dust from construction of the roads and turbine footings that will be brought down to our valley to disturb our quality of life.
5. The adverse affect on the habitat of the ranges, in particular the Turitea Reserve.
6. The divisive effect on our community because certain landowners have agreed to have turbines on their land, while other neighbouring ones do not, and are not compensated for the effects on their property and life. Also, the turbines on private land are closest to dwellings and are therefore some of the most contentious.

**I request the Board of Enquiry to**  
**Refuse consent for the proposed Turitea windfarm for reasons listed above in this submission.**

If however, the decision is to grant consent for the windfarm, I request the following conditions to be applied:

1. Disallow all turbines that are within 3.5km of any dwelling so as to avoid most issues regarding noise.
2. Restrict the maximum height of turbines to 70m to lessen the visual impact of the windfarm.
3. To disallow turbines in the Turitea Reserve to avoid the possibility of contamination of the PN water supply, erosion in the reserve and damage to the reserve ecosystem.
4. To limit the construction traffic on the Pahiatua-Aokautere Road to working hours only, and to limit the volume of windfarm construction traffic to a reasonable quantity of trucks per hour so that the road is still attractive to and safe for cyclists.

*Respectfully submitted,*

*J. P. Koolaard. 23/2/09*

Dr. J.P. KOOLAARD