

136

SUBMISSION ON MIGHTY RIVER POWER LTD APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENT

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Freepost Call In
Ministry for the Environment
PO Box 10362
The Terrace
Wellington 6143

RECEIVED
20 FEB 2009

Email: turiteacallin@mfe.govt.nz
Fax: 04 439 7705

[Note: If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please mark in the subject line: 'Turitea Call In']

This submission relates to the applications for resource consent lodged by Mighty River Power Ltd for the Turitea Wind Farm proposal as identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE AND TIME FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5.00 PM MONDAY 23 FEBRUARY 2009

Title: Mr Mrs ~~Miss~~ ~~Ms~~ (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): KARINE & DAVID CHAGNE

Postal Address: 134 ATAWHAI RD PALMERSTON NORTH 4410

Work Ph: 06 953 7751 Home Ph: 06 357 0417 Cell: 027 631 0585

Work Fax: Home Fax: Email: KDCHAGNE@GMAIL.COM

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all applications for resource consent or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the applications. If you are making a submission only on parts of an application for resource consent, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are:

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

See attached letter.

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

- Reduce the number and size of wind turbines
- Increase the distance from habitations and water catchment
- Reconsider the development strategy of the project
- Establish clear guidelines for this and subsequent wind farm projects

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in respect of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s):

Date:

19/02/09

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mo Te Taiao

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in applications for resource consent that your submission concerns.
Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all applications for resource consent below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the applications for resource consent that I/we have ticked below:

Support Oppose Neutral

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Land-use Consents			
104553: for vegetation clearance and land disturbance in rare or threatened habitats, near streams and on highly erodible land throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104554: for the construction of a double culvert in an un-named tributary of the Kahuterawa Stream as shown on the included map.		✓	
Manawatu-Wanganui (Horizons) Regional Council – Discharge Permits			
104555: for the discharge of dust to air from the concrete batching plants to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104556: for the discharge of dust to air from the mobile crushing plant throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104557: for the discharge of wastewater from two operations and maintenance facilities to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104558: for the discharge of stormwater from substations to land to be located as generally shown on the included map.		✓	
104559: for the discharge of cleanfill to land in the form of spoil disposal sites throughout the general wind farm site.		✓	
104560: for the discharge of stormwater from roads, turbine platforms and other areas to land.		✓	
Palmerston North City Council – Land-use Consents			
RC0068: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to establish and operate a wind farm in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map to undertake earthworks associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction and associated buildings in the areas within the Palmerston North city jurisdiction as generally shown on the included map for the western side of Pahiatua Aokautere Road not meeting access requirements at the location shown on the included map for the storage of diesel (10,000 L) in bunded areas outside the Turitea water supply catchment, generally located at the two substation laydown areas shown on the included map, that exceeds the 0.2 effects ratio maximum in the rural zone for the construction of a 220 kV electricity transmission line and substations as shown on the included map. 		✓	
Tararua District Council – Land-use Consents			
1448: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> for a wind farm (which is not listed as a permitted or controlled activity) in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for land disturbance of more than 200 m³ of soil and cleanfill material associated with tracking and roading, turbine construction, spoil disposal and other associated works in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map for upgrades to South Range Road and the construction of new site access at the location shown on the included map for turbine and wind monitoring mast structures not meeting height requirements within the Tararua District for the modification of a Significant Natural Feature in Schedule 3.3 (ie, Tararua Ranges Ridgeline) for not meeting noise requirements for clearance of indigenous vegetation in the areas within the Tararua District as generally shown on the included map. 		✓	

NOTE: A copy of this submission form MUST also be sent to Mighty River Power Ltd at:

Freeport – MRP
Mighty River Power Ltd
PO Box 445
Hamilton 3240
Attention: Stephanie Froggatt

Or email turitea@mightyriver.co.nz or fax (07) 857 0192

I/we have sent a copy of my/our submission to Mighty River Power Ltd as per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Ministry for the
Environment
Māori Mō Te Taiao

New Zealand Government

Dear sir or madam,

Please find below a list of our concerns regarding the Turitea wind farm project. We believe the current plans are not addressing these issues appropriately. We urge the board of inquiry to ask Mighty River Power to decrease the number of wind turbines, increase the distance from habitations and Palmerston North water catchment, and to consider a more sustainable strategy for the development of the project. We strongly believe the current project only considers short term profits and compromises with Manawatu's quality of life and the fragile ecology of the Turitea catchment.

1/ Impact on the Manawatu / Tararua ecosystem:

- Degradation of the Manawatu river and its tributaries (Tiritea and Kahuterawa) due to the discharge of dust during the (long and extremely desctructive) construction of the wind farm.
- Degradation of Palmerston North city drinking water quality as some of the wind turbines would be located in the water catchment.
- Degradation of native and plantation forests. We are particularly concerned about the native forest, which is one of the last remnants of native bush in the area and which would be destroyed.
- Impact on the local and migratory bird life due to blades rotation.
- Impact on the local fauna due to loss of habitat.

2/ Impact on human:

- Proximity to habitation in the Tiritea and Kahuterawa valleys and in the Pacific Drive neighborhood. We are directly concerned with this issue as our section is only 2 kms away from the nearest wind turbines (0122, 0123, 0124, 0125, 0136, 0135, 0134, 0127, 0128, 0129, 0130, 0131, 0132, 0133), the Browns Flat substation and the transmission line (see attached map).
- Annoyance due to noise, view or the combination of both. This will impact on the life quality of the habitants as we think the naturalness of the site will be lost or at least significantly diminished. We attached some research papers from European studies to document our argument. We believe this will affect us as our section is very close to the wind farm.
- Low-frequency noise influence on cardiovascular conditions. However, we did not find any research article documenting this. This is mainly due to the fact that wind farms have been installed very recently through the world and very few data is available to conclude on the impact of low-frequency noise on human health. Nevertheless, we found a research article about the risk of epilepsy due to the rotating blades.
- Reduction of local property market. The value of houses and sections located close to the wind farm will reduce considerably, creating a critical loss for local owners and potential vendors. We own a 1.8 Ha lifestyle block on Shere lane, off Kahuterawa road. The Turitea wind farm project affects us directly as we are planning to build a house and live on our section. Our decision to buy this piece of land a year and half ago was motivated by our wish to live close to nature, with lots of space and nice views. In fact, the search for a good quality of life was the motivation of our immigration to New Zealand in 2004. The recent announcement

of the Turitea wind farm project made us profoundly rethink our plans for building our house and living in the Kahuterawa valley. In fact, we are currently thinking about abandoning our project if the wind farm is constructed as it is proposed by Mighty River Power.

- The narrow roads (Kahuterawa road and Turitea road) giving access to the wind farms will be more dangerous, especially during the construction process which will involve large trucks. This is a direct hazard to habitants and for recreative activities (e.g. mountain bike is a popular activity in the Kahuterawa reserve). We are concerned by this as Kahuterawa is a very narrow winding road with poor visibility in some corners. Crossing large trucks would be very dangerous.

3/ Aesthetic impact

- Although the wind turbines give a certain local pride and originality to the Manawatu region (e.g. council logos, rugby team etc...) we believe that a large wind farm consisting of new 122 wind turbines, in addition to the 350 already existing or consented to, will spoil the view and alter the beautifulness of the Tararua ranges. This is a concern for all the habitants of the city, as most will have a view toward the turbines. This is a direct concern for us as our house would have view on the range, and would have a view on more than 30 turbines (located around Brown Flat).

4/ Sustainability issues

- The impression given by the size of the project is that the company developing it must have put insufficient consideration in the design and development, of this wind farm as it includes no consideration of the important impacts cited above. Although wind generated power is definitely a sound alternative for New Zealand energy production, a careful and thoughtful planning is needed. We believe that there are too many very large wind turbines planned. We firmly believe that the "the more the better" attitude is not applicable to sustainable development. We have the impression that Mighty River Power planned a large number of wind turbines in the optics of being cut down anyway. This is not a sustainable way to do and this does not create a climate of trust between the local communities and the company. A smart development from the start of the process is needed.

Attached research articles and reports:

E. Pedersen, H. Halmstad (2003) Noise annoyance from wind turbines – a review.

E. Pedersen, K. Persson Wayes (2008) Wind turbines – low level noise sources interfering with restoration? *Environ. Res. Lett.*

G. Harding, P. Harding, A. Wilkins (2008) Wind turbines, flicker, and photosensitive epilepsy: characterizing the flashing that may precipitate seizures and optimizing guidelines to prevent them. *Epilepsia.*

E. Pedersen, P. Larsman (2008) The impact of visual factors on noise annoyance among people living in the vicinity of wind turbines. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*.

J. Bright, R. Langston, R. Bullman, R. Evans, S. Gardner, J. Pearce-Higgins (2008) Map of bird sensitivities to wind farms in Scotland: a tool to aid planning and conservation. *Biological Conservation*.

E. Pedersen, K. Persson Wayes (2004) Perception and annoyance due to wind turbine noise – a dose-response relationship. *Acoustical Society of America*.

Best regards,

Karine and David Chagné

kdchagne@gmail.com