

SUBMISSION ON TRANSPOWER'S NOTICES OF REQUIREMENT AND APPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE CONSENTS

Section 145 of the Resource Management Act 1991

RECEIVED ON

- 5 OCT 2007

1154

To: Minister for the Environment
Freeport Grid Upgrade Submissions
PO Box 4405
Hamilton East
HAMILTON 3247

OR Email: tpcallin@mfe.govt.nz
Fax: 04 439 7700

[If you are emailing or faxing your submission, please make it for the attention of "Grid Upgrade Submissions"]

This submission relates to the notices of requirement and/or applications for resource consent, lodged by Transpower New Zealand Ltd for the North Island Grid Upgrade Project, and identified on the next page.

CLOSING DATE FOR SUBMISSIONS: 5 OCTOBER 2007

Title: Mr Mrs Miss Ms (Please circle the appropriate title(s) or print clearly below)

My/Our Full Name(s): SHARVEEN ANN OXENHAM

Postal Address: 739/1 Oreipunga Rd, RD2 Cambridge

Wk Ph: 078272726 Hm Ph: 078272726 Cell:

Wk Fax: Hm Fax: Email:

Please tick the relevant boxes on the next page to identify whether you are making a submission on all notices of requirement and applications for resource consents or just some of them (please identify).

Please also indicate on the back of this form (✓) whether you support, oppose, or are neutral in relation to the notices of requirement and applications for resource consents. If you are making a submission only on parts of a notice of requirement or application for resource consents, please note this when specifying the reasons for your submission.

The reasons for my/our submission are:

If you are attaching further information tick for yes

Are detailed on a letter enclosed. My main concerns are: Health Issues, Environmental Impact, Visual Pollution, Uneconomic solution, obsolete before future need, lack of research, ^{impact on} local economies, & Maungatutari Ecological Island, tourism.

Please use more pages if you need to.

I/we seek the following decision from the Board of Inquiry (provide precise details including the nature of any conditions sought):

I propose that alternative options need to be researched, ie underground, more economic, solar power options/wind power, sourced where the power is required - north.
Please cancel the 400KV plans!

Please use more pages if you need to.

Use a clear tick in the appropriate box below (✓)

I/we wish to be heard in support of my/our submission (to speak at the public hearing).

I/we DO NOT wish to be heard and hereby make my/our submission in writing only.

Signature(s): Sharveen Oxenham

Date: 3/10/07

(Signature of submitter, or person authorised to sign on their behalf is required. Note signature is not required for electronic (email) submissions. If this is a joint submission by two or more individuals, each individual's signature is required.)



Ministry for the
Environment
Manatū Mō Te Taiao

Use the tick boxes below to indicate the called-in notices of requirement and applications for resource consents that your submission concerns. Use a clear tick in the appropriate box or boxes (✓).

I/we make my/our submission concerning all notices of requirement and applications for resource consents below

OR

My/our submission only concerns the notices of requirement and applications for resource consents that I/we have ticked below:

	Support	Oppose	Neutral
Manukau City Council			
Pakuranga Substation Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Otahuhu Substation Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Brownhill Substation Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Underground Cable – Pakuranga to Brownhill Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Underground Cable – Otahuhu to Brownhill Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 27619			
Franklin District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: L07089			
Waikato District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: DES0011/07			
Matamata-Piako District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: RMR200621			
Waipa District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: DN/0006/07			
South Waikato District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: 240/021			
Taupo District Council			
Overhead Line Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: RM070209			
Whakamaru and Whakamaru North Substation Notice of Requirement. Reference Number: RM070209			
Auckland Regional Council – Resource Consents			
<i>Pakuranga to Brownhill Underground Cable Resource Consents</i>			
Application 34102: Land Use Consent for earthworks			
Application 34370: Discharge of Contaminants to land from ancillary activities that produce wastewater or washwater			
Application 34372: Works in the Bed of a Watercourse			
Application 34373: Diversion of Surface Water			
<i>Overhead Line and Brownhill Substation Resource Consents</i>			
Application 34711: Land Use Consent for earthworks			
Application 34712: Discharge of Contaminants to land			
Environment Waikato – Resource Consents			
<i>Overhead Line and Whakamaru North Substation Resource Consents</i>			
Application 116902: Land Use Consent for vegetation clearance and earthworks			
Application 116903: Discharge Permit for the composting of vegetation			
Application 116904: Land Use Consent for the drilling of tower foundation below the water table			
Application 116905: Discharge Permit for the discharge of site water and drilling fluids from drilling activities into surface water.			

NOTE: A copy of this submission form must also be sent to Transpower as soon as possible at:
 North Island Grid Upgrade Project, Transpower Freepost 182915, PO Box 1021, Wellington
 or email submissions@transpower.co.nz or fax 04 819 7624.

I/we have served a copy of my/our submission on the applicant per Section 96(4) of the RMA.



Mrs Sharleen Oxenham
739/1 Oreipunga Road
RD2 Hora Hora
Cambridge
Ph 07 8282726

To the Hon Pete Hodgson

RE: Proposal from Transpower to build 400K power lines from Whakamaru to Otahuhu.

I object to this proposal in its current form of a 400kV overhead line following the route proposed from Whakamaru to Otahuhu by Transpower NZ.

I believe the following issues necessitate the rejection of this application.

- The uneconomic "Energy Miles" involved
- Health issues
- Environmental issues
- Visual impact/Pollution
- Local economy, including community costs and benefits
- Alternatives to overhead line, including undergrounding

I believe that if the 400 kV overhead line were to follow the proposed route, namely through the inhabited area of Maungatautari including the route past Maungatautari Ecological Island and the Hora Hora District it would endanger health and greatly detract from the quality of life of local people, seriously damage the local environment both as regards the natural environment and the inhabited countryside, contribute nothing to the local economy while seriously damaging it since it would constitute the worst type of 'bad neighbour' non-sustainable development.

It seems ridiculous that those of us living close to the proximity of the Mountain have always had to adhere to certain colours of buildings etc to preserve the scenic aspect of the district (which is fair enough) yet Transpower can over ride this with the worst sort of visual pollution imaginable with its proposed 75m pylons! I think it would be irresponsible and totally disrespectful of the NZ Government to give consent to these pylons. Namely for, (but not exclusive to) the fact that they will pass by Maungatautari Mountain with its Ecological Island. Local people have fundraised hard in excess of \$14 million to protect the Mana of the Mountain and volunteered time and man power to erect a pest proof fence so that the mauri (life force) of the Mountain may be restored and that endangered species and indigenous plants may be reintroduced to share with all New Zealanders. Maungatautari Ecological Island will provide the largest pest-free area on mainland NZ, which will be used to populate other conservation sites where appropriate. It is totally inappropriate for Transpowers pylons to be passing through here!

Worst of all these pylons pass through an area within close proximity to our only School where both of my children attend. Hora Hora School (accommodates Years 1 – 8) and our only Early Childhood education option – Hora Hora Playcentre (accommodates children from birth to 6 years) which means that there is the potential for local children with no other schooling options to spend a good percentage of their childhood directly exposed to the high Electromagnetic

Radiation that is strongly linked to childhood leukaemia as well as other types of cancers, serious illness and miscarriage to name a few. I wonder how many other schools this proposed route passes through and how many other children will be affected? I wonder if the NZ Government has thought about the future potential National health bill should these pylons go ahead? (I ask you to read the enclosed story from NZ Herald published April 24, 2005)

Mr Hodgson, Sir, you have the power to make the right decisions on behalf of all of these innocent children and their families please make the wise decision. I ask you, would you like your children or Grandchildren to grow up with the constant threat of Electromagnetic Radiation on their health?

We are dairy farmers and I feel our stock also deserve the right to graze on pastures unpolluted with Electromagnetic Radiation, while the cows are grazing under these lines or in close proximity to them they too will suffer and no doubt our district will experience a higher rate of infertility and miscarriages in our herds, not to mention deformities and overall reduced health and bloodline strength of our milking herds. There is also the unanswered question about the radiation being passed into the human food chain via the milk and meat from these animals and the lack of research done in these areas.

These lines will pass through and impact the nearby Karapiro district including Karapiro Lake Domain (home of the Rowing World Champs 2010) and Tony Tay Group's 26 million purpose built five-star Karapiro Wellness Centre which is going to specialise in treatment and convalescence of people with serious illness among other state of the art wellness programs. This centre alone could be adversely affected and therefore impact on local community as this is going to be a big tourism prospect for our town including employment for 60 full-time permanent staff as well as numerous local contractors and suppliers of goods and services.

On television we are always being told about "Food miles" and how they impact the environment... so it seems ridiculous that New Zealand would freight energy from one end of the country to the other being Auckland – where the need is, at a huge expense, economically, visually, environmentally, socially and to its national health.

Surely there must be other options?? Some ideas I had included:

- Incentives or regulations for new houses to be built with solar power and gas provisions and energy efficient regulations so that the future demand for power is considered
- Energy Tax for Aucklanders?!
- What about a wind farm up north where the power is being demanded by population
- Why does the rest of the country have to suffer the pylons on Aucklanders behalf?

Please Mr Hodgson, put a stop to these pylons and help New Zealand find a safer and more economically viable solution to our energy needs. I am so grateful for this beautiful countryside that us fellow NZers get to call home – aren't you? Please don't allow it to be "defaced" with monstrous towers!

Yours faithfully



Sharleen Oxenham (I am a 34 & mother of two healthy children aged 7yrs and 3 yrs)



National Story

Powerlines cast cancer cloud

12:00AM Sunday April 24, 2005

By Kirsty Wynn

Two neighbours of high-profile cancer victim and film-maker Cameron Duncan have been diagnosed with the disease – adding further weight to concerns about the apparent dangers of overhead power lines.

While overseas investigations have found clear links between electromagnetic radiation and childhood leukaemia and other forms of cancer, little research has been done in New Zealand.

The Auckland District Health Board has carried out an investigation into the apparent cancer cluster in Massey, West Auckland, but found cancer rates there were no higher than in other areas of a similar population level.

But the research data was based on who was living in the target area up until 2001 and did not take into account the recent cases, which included Cameron and four others at Massey's Royal Road school.

An Auckland urologist, who has studied the connection between high-voltage power pylons and cancer, has found strong links between high-tension power lines and childhood cancer, breast cancer and depression.

Meanwhile, energy giant Transpower – which is proposing a controversial 400kV line from Whakamaru to South Auckland – says its lines are safe.

Months after the death of her son Cameron, Sharon Duncan remains adamant about the reasons he went to an early grave – constant exposure to electromagnetic radiation from overhead power lines.

She was shocked to hear two more of her neighbours had been diagnosed with the disease that had killed her son.

"That takes the number of people with cancer surrounding our house up to five," Mrs Duncan said.

"We had already lost two immediate neighbours to cancer and then Cameron.

"And we have a power pole right in the middle of all the houses concerned."

One of the latest neighbours to be diagnosed is Parvati Smith, who lives directly in front of the Duncans' home.

"There seems to be a lot of us in the street who have cancer," Mrs Smith told the Herald on Sunday.

"I think it needs to be looked into properly – there are too many people around here with it."

Mrs Smith, who lives next door to Cameron's former home, and Dorothy Tyler, who lives directly across the road, have both been diagnosed with breast cancer in the past year.

The street has power lines running through it – directly over the Duncans' home and over the Smiths.

Mrs Smith said finding she had breast cancer in a routine mammogram in March was a huge shock.

"I was in a daze because I am very healthy and have no family history but we do have the power lines over the house.

"My husband was quite worried about the powerlines and had copper wiring put through the house a while back."

Mrs Smith does not know for sure what caused her cancer but said she was considering moving.

"We have lived here for 23 years but it has made me think about it. I spoke to Sharon and she told us to get out."

Mrs Duncan sold her Anich Rd property last year, saying she lived in a cancer triangle.

It was also last year that details emerged that Cameron and two close friends – Jeffrey Thumath and Charles Hetaraka – were diagnosed with cancer within two months of each other.

Cameron and Charles both died in 2003 when they were 17 and New Zealand athletics champion Jeffrey, now 20, will soon have surgery for lung and stomach cancer.

The boys shared a number of commonalities including being born at St Helen's Hospital in Waitakere, attending the same school, playing competitive sport, and being diagnosed and receiving treatment within two months of each other.

Their mothers – Gail Thumath, Elizabeth Hetaraka and Sharon Duncan – all had a link to the West Auckland suburbs while they were pregnant.

It was also revealed last year that two other Royal Road School pupils and another local boy living near the school had cancer.

Kristian Gibson was 14 when he died of a brain tumour. He was at Royal Road School at the same time as the three boys and died in the same year as Charles and Cameron.

Another Royal Road pupil – who did not want to be named – developed pre-cancerous cells in the same year.

Local boy Samuel England, 18, was diagnosed with cancer at 10 months of age but is now clear of the disease.

Since then, other Massey residents with cancer, and parents who have lost children to cancer, have come forward demanding answers.

Families bordering a sub-station in Timandra Ave in Massey claimed their cats were having litters of deformed kittens, and living near the power centre was making them sick.

The Savaiinaea family have two children with leukaemia and their mother, Violet, had a miscarriage last month at 22 weeks.

Mrs Savaiinaea's two children Sone, 8, and Alesha, 6, were born near substations – Sone when the family was living in Otara and Alesha in Timandra Place.

Along with leukaemia, Alesha has severe asthma and Sone has epilepsy. Both children have Netherton's Syndrome – a disease which causes their skin to peel and become infected and makes them lose weight.

Her other children – who were not born near the substation – are healthy.

Mrs Savaiinaea – a taxi-call-centre worker – was made distraught by the miscarriage. It is the second she has had since moving to Timandra Place.

"I knew something was wrong and I thought the baby had leukaemia because the pregnancy was the same as when I had Alesha.

"I was about five months pregnant and I went to the doctor for something else and they found the baby had stopped breathing," she said.

"The doctors had already told me if I got pregnant again there was a 60 per cent chance I would have another baby with leukaemia."

Mrs Savaiinaea said her family has suffered ill health since moving to the street eight years ago.

All the homes in the cul de sac are owned by Housing New Zealand.

She is convinced the substation has made her and her family sick and said her mother doesn't visit any more because she gets headaches every time she visits.

"My mother has stopped coming around now because she gets bad headaches every time she comes out here. She said it is the power station, so we have to take the kids to see her now."

Mrs Savaiinaea said no one should be allowed to live under power lines or near a substation.

The Auckland District Health Board launched an investigation into the apparent cancer cluster late last year and released a report three weeks ago stating there was no elevated risk in the area.

The report said the incidence of cancer in the area was not elevated and "no environmental cancer-causing agents link the occurrence of the cancers involved".

But the mothers of Cameron, Charles and Jeffrey said the report used outdated information and drew conclusions from a cancer register which did not include their sons.

Mrs Duncan, along with Mrs Hetaraka and Mrs Thumath noted the cancer registry referred to went up to 2001 while their sons were diagnosed in 2002.

Medical specialist Dr Robin Smart has been studying the relationship between power pylons and health effects since he found Transpower's proposed 400kV line from Whakamaru to South Auckland would run 300m from his Whitford property.

The Auckland urologist has read 100 medical papers and found strong links with overhead lines and health conditions like severe depression, childhood leukaemia – which is two or three times higher – and breast cancer.

He said the power limits in New Zealand were far too high.

"Research shows that if you live near lines with more than 0.1 micro tesla of magnetic radiation there is evidence you are at risk."

He said levels here – set by the World Health Organisation – were far too high.

"They have set very high levels of 200 micro tesla. It is so high a lot of countries are now stopping people from living under the lines."

Mr Smart said the solution to the power-pylon debate was using the safer DC lines – rather than

the AC lines which have alternating or pulsing current – and putting them underground.

Transpower spokesman Chris Roberts said the company maintained the lines to the Ministry of Health guidelines. "We are not health experts – we just do as we are told," Mr Roberts said.

THE STORY SO FAR

1985 Jeffrey Thumath born at St Helen's Hospital in Waitakere.

1986 Cameron Duncan and Charles Hetaraka born at St Helen's.

1988 Kristian Gibson born in Melbourne, Australia.

2001 Gibson diagnosed in August with cancerous brain tumour.

2002 Hetaraka and Duncan both diagnosed with cancer.

2003 Thumath diagnosed with cancer. Gibson dies in February, aged 14. In July Charles Hetaraka, 17, dies. Duncan dies in November.

2004 Dorothy Tyler diagnosed in April with breast cancer.

2005 Parvati Smith diagnosed this month with breast cancer.

– HERALD ON SUNDAY