

RECEIVED ON

- 5 OCT 2007

1094

**RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ACT 1991
SECTION 96 SUBMISSION TO A NOTICE OF REQUIREMENT**

TO: Minister for the Environment
Freeport Grid Upgrade Submissions
POBox 4405
Hamilton East
HAMILTON 3237

FROM: Botany Community Board,
c/- Manukau City Council
Private Bag 76917
MANUKAU CITY

The Botany Community Board (BCB) makes this submission to oppose in part the Notices of Requirement (NOR) by:

Transpower New Zealand Ltd for:

- A new overhead transmission line from Whakamaru to Brownhill Rd, which will be 400kV capable but operate initially at 220kV;
- Modifications to the existing substation at Pakuranga;
- Modifications to the existing substation at Otahuhu;
- A transition station/substation at Brownhill Rd;
- A 220kV underground cable section from the transition station/substation Board to Pakuranga substation;
- A 220kV underground cable section from the transition station/substation to Otahuhu substation.

The particular parts of the Notices of Requirement that this submission relates to are:

Principally those parts of the NOR which are within the boundaries of the Botany Community Ward. (Parts II, III, V, VI, VII)

The reasons for the Botany Community Boards submission are:

GENERAL

1. The Flat Bush/Botany area, through which the undergrounding is to go is an area of high, and rapid growth. Further, an overall plan Variation 13 applies for the whole of the basin between Point View Drive and Redoubt Road/ Redoubt Road Ridge area, including the land around Regis Heights. Accordingly, the references to rural land within this area are no longer appropriate, though still applicable to land affected by Whitford Plan Change 8

2. This project is anticipated to cover a period of more than 30 years until completion. All compliances, Guidelines etc as referred to in various parts of the documentation must

be in terms of the operative standards at the time construction of each stage takes place, not those in place at the time NOR is granted.

This one NOR covers conditions under which construction of the final stage will not be commenced until circa 2032. It is completely unacceptable that Transpower (or whoever the current owner of the network may be by then) has only to comply with today's current Guidelines, Standards etc. In the area of noise, vibration, light spill, general nuisance, additional traffic and particularly, EMF and RFE and EPR, future research could show that current standards are completely inadequate, and it is therefore necessary that all conditions throughout state that all compliance be in line with the applicable Standards, Guidelines etc. at the time of construction of each stage. This will need to be stated under the approved conditions to ensure adequate protection for residents and the community at large.

3. In a number of places, reference is made to the nuisance of dust, particularly when material is being moved offsite. In all cases, reference is made to the fact that the truck loads 'MAY' be covered. – given the built up nature of the Pakuranga sites, and the likelihood that the Redoubt Road area will be completely built up by the start of this project, it is necessary that all loads 'WILL be covered.'

4. There appears to be no discussion of penalties included if mitigation measures are not met. To ensure that time lines and conditions are complied with, especially in relation to instream works, substantial fines should be included in the final contracts to encourage full compliance with the conditions and mitigation measures.

5. In a number of places throughout the documentation reference is made to 'replanting.....as far as practical' This is not acceptable given that principally existing, already mature indigenous forest is at stake. The removal of the words 'as far as practical' is required in all clauses relating to minimization of disturbance patches of bush. If the developer has had to work around these areas to ensure their protection, or provide alternative replanting, why should Transpower be treated any differently.

6. In a number of places throughout the documentation reference is made to 'Existing Utilities' with no indication of responsibility in the event of damage to same.

The costs of altering the position of, or damage to, existing network utility services or interference or disruption of the operation of same must be met totally by Transpower. Given that this is an area of recent growth, the existing network services are modern and new.

While it is acknowledged that the undergrounding of this cable is necessary, it must not be at the expense of existing modern services which are equally as important.

PART II - Section 4: Objectives

While it is stated this Project is required to 'ensure continued security of supply' to the Auckland area and North, the question still arises as to what new generating operations are to be built to utilize this resource.

Has adequate consideration been given to the building of a generating plant within the Auckland area to provide sufficient additional power to cover the needs of the region and north without such major expenditure.

It appears that Submission 1 of the BCB submission of 9 August 2006 has not been noted.

PART III PAKURANGA SUBSTATION

2.1 Given that the existing Pakuranga Substation is in the middle of a mid density residential area, it is appropriate that all the land as indicated in Fig.1 (p2) be designated.

Steps should be taken to ensure an adequate buffer zone exists between the structures and the boundary with residential/commercial properties. Further, this buffer zone should be formalized by notation on both the relevant Certificates of Title and Council records to ensure it remains as such.

Although there was a poor response from the community during the period of consultation and submission, this is an inadequate reason for determining that an AIS system is appropriate. Given that this is in an area of medium density residential zoning, it would be appropriate that the GIS switchgear system be installed. This area already has far more housing surrounding it than is likely will ever be surrounding the Brownhill substation, and it is appropriate that the new installation be an enclosed unit.

Further, it is acknowledged in the documentation that GIS is considered as being more reliable and will increase the security of supply. Visually, it is also a better solution.

PART IV - Otahuhu Substation (not within Botany CB area)

PART V - Brownhill Substation

It is appropriate that all earthworks be completed at the initial stages of development providing for both the interim and the final substations

Undertakings should be given regarding the protection of existing bush, regardless of size, and especially that area known as Carpenters Bush.

Undertakings are also required regarding protection of the headwaters of the Turanga Stream and all other waterways referred to within the documentation.

6.1 Noise

By the time construction begins on this project in 2011, it is likely that the development of life style blocks on Redoubt Road will be complete. Daytime average noise levels could therefore be substantially lower than current measurements, and it should be a requirement that new noise measurements be undertaken at the time construction starts and new noise levels established.

It should be a condition that the noise of the generator to be used in commissioning the substation not exceed levels as set out in the then current District Plan.

Given that this site adjoins a rural residential area, (Redoubt Rd Ridge) working hours on site should be restricted to 7 am to 7.30 pm. No one should have to put up with construction noises between 7.30pm to 10pm or before 7 am.

It should be a condition of consent that early planting of trees to mitigate the visual effects of the substation on site be undertaken once confirmation of the substation site and access road have been determined.

PART VI UNDERGROUND CABLE – PAKURANGA –BROWNHILL

Comments are made on the basis that the designation will apply only to Option 2 – Brownhill/Whitford Park/Sandstone Rds as advised in the Executive Summary.

6.8 Land Stability & Erosion

Given that the Executive Summary advises that Option 2 is to be the operative route, it is not clear why reference is made to the area below the ridge line of Regis Lane on p 60. As Option 2 Route runs along Brownhill/Whitford Park and Sandstone Rds before joining up with Ormiston/Cauldwell I fail to see the relevance of this paragraph dealing with Regis Lane and wish to seek further clarification and reserve the right to comment if necessary. (I have left voice messages with Transpower staff regarding this, but to date had no response.)

It needs to be remembered that the NOR documentation relates to the state of indigenous forest/ground cover as at April 2007 (the date of the documentation) if not a little earlier. There will be at least a further 4 years growth in this area before the work is commenced, if the current and expected timetable is complied with.

It is also possible that by the commencement of this project, the majority of development in the Regis Heights area will have been completed, thus leading to the upgrading of stream environments. It should be a condition of consent that nothing be done to downgrade the stream environment as it exists at the time work commences on site.

6.11.1 p59 Surely it is possible to avoid that area of the Maungamaungaroa Stream which has established ground cover and mature indigenous riparian forest vegetation.

This area has been protected by generations of residents, the Stream reserve has been the site of numerous community planting days and is highly regarded by the community. There must be an alternative route which will not result in the destruction of mature trees. Further consultation with Parks staff, Manukau CC, responsible for the area is requested to determine an alternative route.

Given the effect on stream life, and particularly juvenile native fish species including the banded kokopu, it should be a condition that all work on or within, the streams should be done during the late summer period.

PART VII UNDERGROUND CABLE BROWNHILL-OTAHUHU

Comment is only on area relating to the area within Botany Ward ie from the eastern side of Te Irirangi Drive and the MCC Stormwater Management Area between that and Chapel Rd and east to the Redoubt Road Ridge development.

5 Environment

Transpower is to be congratulated for the efforts taken to ensure as little disturbance of the new residential areas and the plantings within Barry Curtis Park. However, care must be taken to ensure that under no circumstances are the trees lining Stancombe Road to be damaged. By the time this work is undertaken in 2021 and 2023, these trees will be 15 to 20 years old and an important part of the environment. Further, the children's playground is already an important and popular community asset, and steps will need to be taken to ensure continued access to that facility

5.5 Private Land

Land between Jeffs and Ormiston Rds.

From the locality map provided with the NOR documents it is not possible to determine the exact line of the underground route. From the description given, it appears that this is the only land owned by individuals. Presumably every effort will be taken to work with the current owners to ensure that the route follows a logical placement allowing maximum subdivisional potential. Alternatively, that compensation is paid making full allowance for the intrusion.

5.6.1

Our understanding is that the Jeffs Road schools are to be a contributing (primary) and a middle school. The secondary college is to be built in Ormiston Rd opposite the new Town Centre.

5.9.2 Perennial Streams Regis Lane

The perennial streams in the Regis Lane area are part of the Greenfinger development under Variation 13. Further, while these streams may currently be 'pastoral' in nature,

and stock have access at present, they form part of the plan to ensure adequate recreational areas within the Flat Bush development area. They need to be protected.

Under Variation 13, the land within the Regis Lane area is to be, or has been, rezoned to Flat Bush Countryside Transition.

It is no longer zoned 'Rural' and by the time construction on this project commences, will likely be fully built up, thus conditions applying to Rural areas will be inapplicable.

5.10 Vegetation

Removal of mature native trees and vegetation throughout this region should be regarded as a last resort.

5.10.5

While the land between Redoubt Rd Extension and the Substation may currently be 'managed in agricultural land use' and 'pastoral in nature' it is zoned for Flat Bush Countryside Transition. This alters both its value and its applicable use.

6.7 Stormwater Management areas.

Given that the stormwater management areas are already well established, and will be even more so in 20 years time when construction on this aspect of this project commences, Transpower must ensure minimal interference with the existing planted areas of the stormwater management areas. Timing will be essential to ensure that construction takes place during the driest period of the year.

Further, at the time of construction of this cable, it is likely that the whole of the Flat Bush valley through to the Redoubt Road Ridge, will be built up, increasing the importance of the stormwater management areas.

It is part of Variation 13 requirements that developers plant up stormwater management areas as development takes place. There is no point in MCC insisting on plantings when in 10 years time the plantings will be destroyed to enable this project to proceed.

Transpower should be required to provide at the earliest opportunity, the determined line of the undergrounding, (including the additional area required while construction takes place) to enable plantings in those areas not affected by the cable or its construction, with additional plantings to be established by Transpower once the cable is in place.

6.11.3 Te Irirangi/Otara Creek tributary.

6.11.4 Perennial streams, Regis Lane

By the time this project is under way, the plantings referred to in this paragraph will be mature. The fact that it has previously been rural land is now insignificant and has been since discussions began over the timed development of the land within Variation 13 in 1997. Further, the water quality will possibly have improved, as in 20 years time, it is likely all development above this stream will have been completed. Whatever

measures are to be instigated regarding vegetation, water quality and aquatic ecology protection must be determined at the time the work is proposed, taking into account the then current situation of the area, not the position at the present day.

6.12 Heritage

Although not within the Botany/Flat Bush Ward, the St Johns Church and Hampton Park areas are of considerable heritage value being among the few protected colonial assets within the wider Otara/Flat Bush area. Accordingly, it is important that full heritage value be extended to them and that they are protected totally.

Relief Sought:

That the Board of Inquiry:

- Confirm the importance of enhancing the security of supply to the Auckland Region
- To ensure the suggested conditions as requested are included within the terms of consent to protect the environment and community
- To ensure time lines are included in the Terms of Consent to ensure least possible disruption to the environment and community
- Ensure that sufficient generating operations are to be built to utilize this resource.

The Botany Community Board does wish to be heard in support of this submission.

Signed for and on behalf of the
BOTANY COMMUNITY BOARD

M A Burrill
Deputy Chair,
Botany Community Board.
Dated this 5th day of October, 2007.

Address for Contact:
Botany Community Board, Attention Charles Rhodes
Manukau City Council
Private Bag 76917
MANUKAU CITY.

Cc:

North Island Grid Upgrade Project
Transpower Freepost 182915
PO Box 1021
WELLINGTON