

RECEIVED ON

- 5 OCT 2007

0915

Colin W.Bull
415 Clevedon/Takanini Rd.
Clevedon
R.D.2 Papakura

Ph 09 292 8758 Fx 09 292 9105
mob 0274 826936
Email colinbull@xtra.co.nz

4th October 2007

Submission

Transpower North Island Grid Upgrade Project
Whakamaru to Otahuhu Transmission Line

I wish to be heard in support of my submission.

I thank the commission for the opportunity to make this submission.

First Point: No one wants to see the lights go out in Auckland.

Where is the Electricity to come from?

There is no spare electricity generating capacity to supply electricity along the proposed new lines, so there is no point in building the new line.

Action requested:

Decline the consent until a full study has been done on future electricity generating options in New Zealand and projected electricity requirements assessed.

Should consent be granted: That it be for an upgrade of existing lines only till such time as the full study is completed, and a condition of that consent be that landowners receive payment for inconvenience and ongoing annual rental with periodic reviews.

(see appendix A for some issues to be considered in any study)

Transmission:

In costing all the options it must be recognized that landowners no longer accept that they have a duty to allow electricity carrying pylons and wires to traverse their properties without adequate compensation.

With the privatization of electricity generation, transmission and supply, the old days of public good have disappeared and landowners, along with everyone and every business associated with electricity must be credited all costs associated with transmission lines.

This payment must be in two parts: (a) compensation for inconvenience at the time of installation, and (b) An on going reviewable lease to cover on going inconvenience and loss of land use with consideration also given in each review for possible land use changes,

Action requested:

Decline the consent.

Should consent be granted it be for an upgrade of existing lines only till such time as the full study is completed, and a condition of that consent be that landowners receive payment for inconvenience and ongoing annual rental with periodic reviews.

Transmission Corridor:

The transmission corridor must be a minimum of 200M plus the width of the base of the tower. This allows 90M of fall zone when a pylon falls over with a safety margin of 10M.

Action requested:

Decline the consent.

Should the consent be granted a condition be that the transmission corridor be at least 200M plus the base of the pylon.

Appendix A

Some Issues to be discussed in any review but not limited to these only

1/ Electricity could be supplied to Auckland from:

- (i) If suitable supplies of coal could be found a new coal fired station at Meremere could deliver electricity down presently unused transmission lines to Auckland
- (ii) Marsden Point Power Station could be brought on line or a new station built to supply additional electricity to Northland and to deliver electricity down presently unused transmission lines to Auckland
- (iii) The Otahuhu gas fired power station could be doubled in size and I note that resource consents have already been granted for that.

2/ The present transmission lines from the Waikato River to Otahuhu could be upgraded to take a considerably greater load, before it becomes necessary to build a new line.

4/ Wind powered generation could supply up to 10% of Auckland's needs. Wind power generation is very compatible with hydro generation. Wind power must be considered because of its nil greenhouse gas emissions. Wind Power generation however needs back up for when the wind is not blowing and transmission lines will still need to be capable of supplying peak loads as the wind may not be blowing at peak load times.

We are now all well aware of the very serious concerns over global climate change caused by greenhouse gases, and the consequences of continuing to expand electricity generation from hydrocarbon fuels. Not only do we need to consider the financial cost of the greenhouse gas penalty payments imposed by the Kyoto Agreement but more importantly we must consider the damage to the life sustainability of the environment from these increased greenhouse gas emissions. Carbon costs are set to add 2 cents kWh for coal fired generation and an extra 1 cent for gas. All these points and more do not mean we should not use coal fired generation they are just more factors that need to be considered.

With present interest in electricity generation and transmission it is opportune that New Zealand look anew at nuclear energy as a source of electricity generation.

Nuclear energy is economically viable compared to other forms of power generation

It may be true to say that economic nuclear energy electricity generators are too large for New Zealand's requirements and that smaller generators are too expensive but it is essential that New Zealand keeps up to date with this technology and has tentative plans for its use in some five or ten years time.

In 2005 it was reported that: "Nuclear power now provides one sixth of the world's electricity. There are 440 power reactors operational producing 16% of the world's electricity. (20% America 75% France) A further 30 reactors are currently under construction

As much electricity is generated from nuclear sources as from all sources in 1961 (2,500 billion kWh)

Nuclear power has been producing electricity for almost 50 years. Nuclear power stations operate in 30 countries. Every year more countries are added to that list. China and India plan to increase nuclear generation capacity by four times before 2020. Japan, South Korea, Finland, Russia and Eastern Europe are increasing capacity."

Nuclear powered electricity plants are environmentally friendly. Wind power (also non carbon and environmentally friendly) costs much more per kWh and is inconsistent, so the cost of backup generation needs to be factored in.

The increased use of nuclear powered electricity generation will have a dramatic effect in reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

There is considerable resistance in New Zealand to Nuclear energy electricity generation however it has to be noted 26 tonnes of U3O8 produces the energy that would produce 1,000,000 tonnes of CO2 from coal fired electricity generation.

I repeat again that yes there are concerns in New Zealand over safety, however third generation nuclear power plants are being built considerably safer than the thoroughly safety proven 2nd generation plants

A partial core meltdown at the Three Mile Island nuclear reactor in Middletown, Pennsylvania 28th March 1979 shook up the risk factor with a tremendous improvement in fail safe systems following. In that event equipment failures and worker mistakes contributed to a loss of coolant. It was the worst commercial nuclear accident in the Western world, however there were no casualties.

The worst nuclear accident in the history of nuclear power occurred at the Chernobyl nuclear power plant near Kiev in the Ukraine. Fire and explosions resulting from an unauthorized experiment left 31 dead in the immediate aftermath. Technological improvements since then will mean that a Chernobyl type reactor will never be built again. Except for that Chernobyl accident in 1986 there have been no more loss of life in nuclear generators than in any other type of electricity generating plant.

Currently a pebble reactor is being trialed which cannot melt down and has even been tested with all cooling systems switched off. An earlier prototype pebble bed modular reactor (PBMR) in Germany was operated for more than 20 years.

Cost of Transmission:

Some of the cost of transmission should be born by the generating companies. That would mean that the generating companies would need to consider that cost when planning the site for their generators. Generating companies should not be required to pay all the cost of transmission as the consumer also needs to consider their electricity transmission cost when considering all their costs involved when siting their business or private enterprises.

The Transpower controversy has at least brought the issue to public attention. We now come to realise that New Zealand does not yet have a transmission problem we have a generation problem. An electricity crisis is now predicted within the next decade.

The failure of partial privatization of the electricity industry:

Privitisation of the electricity industry in 1998 was supposed to mean that the competitive market would spot a potential shortfall and build more power stations.

When Max Bradford was the minister in charge a partial privatisation of the electricity industry was commenced. Nothing further towards complete privatisation has happened since, and we now have the worst of both worlds private ownership or state ownership. Because of the virtual monopoly of the present state involvement in electricity generation private industry is not prepared to invest in new generating capacity as the state controls the prices charged. Because of our unique power generation in New Zealand it can reasonably be accepted that the competitive free market electricity industry would not be the best answer to efficient low cost electricity for New Zealand consumers.

Hydro generators when surplus water was gushing over their spillways would obviously be prepared to cut prices. At that stage gas a coal could not compete

We presently have the worst of both worlds.

The need for an independent inquiry is urgent. It must be set up quickly and must be require to report back early.

We need to act quickly

Issues that need to be looked at.

Where will more electricity be needed?

Where and by what means should that electricity be generated?

Should government own any or all generating stations or should all generation be privatized?

During the earlier 1005-06 consultation process Transpower admitted that New Zealand has a generation problem not a transmission problem.

Other Issues:

I am reliably informed that there are other transmission lines in the Auckland region liable to fail for lack of a maintenance and renewal plans, giving blackouts to Auckland similar to those of a few years ago.

I wish to be heard in support of my submission.

Colin W. Bull

ENDS

Steve Rice

From: TPCallin [TPCallin@mfe.govt.nz]
Sent: Friday, 5 October 2007 6:29 a.m.
To: rice-resources-ltd@clear.net.nz
Subject: FW: Submission on NI Grid Upgrade



Electricity
ubmission Oct 200..

From: COLIN BULL[SMTP:COLINBULL@XTRA.CO.NZ]
Sent: Friday, 5 October 2007 6:25:46 a.m.
To: TPCallin
Subject: Submission on NI Grid Upgrade
Auto forwarded by a Rule

My submission is on this front page of my email and also attached as a word document:

Colin W.Bull

Ph 09 292 8758 Fx 09 292 9105 415

Clevedon/Takanini Rd.

mob 0274 826936

Clevedon
colinbull@xtra.co.nz

Email <mailto:colinbull@xtra.co.nz>

R.D.2 Papakura

4th October 2007

Submission

Transpower North Island Grid Upgrade Project

Whakamaru to Otahuhu Transmission Line

I wish to be heard in support of my submission.

I thank the commission for the opportunity to make this submission.

First Point: No one wants to see the lights go out in Auckland.

Where is the Electricity to come from?

There is no spare electricity generating capacity to supply electricity along the proposed new lines, so there is no point in building the new line.

Action requested:

Decline the consent until a full study has been done on future electricity generating options in New Zealand and projected electricity requirements assessed.

Should consent be granted: That it be for an upgrade of existing lines only till such time as the full study is completed, and a condition of that consent be that landowners receive payment for inconvenience and ongoing annual rental with periodic reviews.

(see appendix A for some issues to be considered in any study)

Transmission;

In costing all the options it must be recognized that landowners no longer accept that they have a duty to allow electricity carrying pylons and wires to traverse their properties without adequate compensation.

With the privatization of electricity generation, transmission and supply, the old days of public good have disappeared and landowners, along with everyone and every business associated with electricity must be credited all costs associated with transmission lines.

This payment must be in two parts: (a) compensation for inconvenience at the time of installation, and (b) An on going reviewable lease to cover on going inconvenience and loss of land use with consideration also given in each review for possible land use changes,

Action requested:

Decline the consent.

Should consent be granted it be for an upgrade of existing lines only till such time as the full study is completed, and a condition of that consent be that landowners receive payment for inconvenience and ongoing annual rental with periodic reviews.

Transmission Corridor:

The transmission corridor must be a minimum of 200M plus the width of the base of the tower. This allows 90M of fall zone when a pylon falls over with a safety margin of 10M.

Action requested:

Decline the consent.

Should the consent be granted a condition be that the transmission corridor be at least 200M plus the base of the pylon.

Appendix A

Some Issues to be discussed in any review but not limited to these only

1/ Electricity could be supplied to Auckland from:

(i) If suitable supplies of coal could be found a new coal fired station at Meremere could deliver electricity down presently unused transmission lines to Auckland

(ii) Marsden Point Power Station could be brought on line or a new station built to supply additional electricity to Northland and to deliver electricity down presently unused transmission lines to Auckland

(iii) The Otahuhu gas fired power station could be doubled in size and I note that resource consents have already been granted for that.

2/ The present transmission lines from the Waikato River to Otahuhu could be upgraded to take a considerably greater load, before it becomes necessary to build a new line.

4/ Wind powered generation could supply up to 10% of Auckland's needs. Wind power generation is very compatible with hydro generation. Wind power must be considered because of its nil greenhouse gas emissions. Wind Power generation however needs back up for when the wind is not blowing and transmission lines will still need to be capable of supplying peak loads as the wind may not be blowing at peak load times.

We are now all well aware of the very serious concerns over global climate change caused by greenhouse gases, and the consequences of continuing to expand electricity generation from hydrocarbon fuels. Not only do we need to consider the financial cost of the greenhouse gas penalty payments imposed by the Kyoto Agreement but more importantly we must consider the damage to the life sustainability of the environment from these increased greenhouse gas emissions. Carbon costs are set to add 2 cents kWh for coal fired generation and an extra 1 cent for gas. All these points and more do not mean we should not use coal fired generation they are just more factors that need to be considered.

With present interest in electricity generation and transmission it is opportune that New Zealand look anew at nuclear energy as a source of electricity generation.

Nuclear energy is economically viable compared to other forms of power generation

It may be true to say that economic nuclear energy electricity generators are too large for New Zealand's requirements and that smaller generators are too expensive but it is essential that New Zealand keeps up to date with this technology and has tentative plans for its use in some five or ten years time.

In 2005 it was reported that: "Nuclear power now provides one sixth of the world's electricity. There are 440 power reactors operational producing 16% of the world's electricity. (20% America 75% France) A further 30 reactors are currently under construction

As much electricity is generated from nuclear sources as from all sources in 1961 (2,500 billion kWh)

Nuclear power has been producing electricity for almost 50 years. Nuclear power stations operate in 30 countries. Every year more countries are added to that list. China and India plan to increase nuclear generation capacity by four times before 2020. Japan, South Korea, Finland, Russia and Eastern Europe are increasing capacity."

Nuclear powered electricity plants are environmentally friendly. Wind power (also non carbon and environmentally friendly) costs much more per kWh and is inconsistent, so the cost of backup generation needs to be factored in.

The increased use of nuclear powered electricity generation will have a dramatic effect in reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

There is considerable resistance in New Zealand to Nuclear energy electricity generation however it has to be noted 26 tonnes of U3O8 produces the energy that would produce 1,000,000 tonnes of CO2 from coal fired electricity generation.

I repeat again that yes there are concerns in New Zealand over safety, however third generation nuclear power plants are being built considerably safer than the thoroughly safety proven 2nd generation plants

A partial core meltdown at the <http://three-mile-island.biography.ms/> Three Mile Island nuclear reactor in

http://www.biography.ms/Middletown%2C_Pennsylvania.html Middletown, Pennsylvania 28th March 1979 shook up the risk factor with a tremendous improvement in fail safe systems following. In that event equipment failures and worker mistakes contributed to a loss of coolant. It was the worst commercial nuclear accident in the Western world, however there were no casualties.

The worst nuclear accident in the history of nuclear power occurred at the <http://chernobyl.biography.ms/> Chernobyl nuclear power plant near <http://kiev.biography.ms/> Kiev in the Ukraine. Fire and explosions resulting from an unauthorized experiment left 31 dead in the immediate aftermath. Technological improvements since then will mean that a Chernobyl type reactor will never be built again. Except for that Chernobyl accident in 1986 there have been no more loss of life in nuclear generators than in any other type of electricity generating plant.

Currently a pebble reactor is being trialed which cannot melt down and has even been tested with all cooling systems switched off. An earlier prototype pebble bed modular reactor (PBMR) in Germany was operated for more than 20 years.

Cost of Transmission:

Some of the cost of transmission should be born by the generating companies. That would mean that the generating companies would need to consider that cost when planning the site for their generators. Generating companies should not be required to pay all the cost of transmission as the consumer also needs to consider their electricity transmission cost when considering all their costs involved when siting their business or private enterprises.

The Transpower controversy has at least brought the issue to public attention. We now come to realise that New Zealand does not yet have a transmission problem we have a generation problem. An electricity crisis is now predicted within the next decade.

The failure of partial privatization of the electricity industry:

Privatisation of the electricity industry in 1998 was supposed to mean that the competitive market would spot a potential shortfall and build more power stations.

When Max Bradford was the minister in charge a partial privatisation of the electricity industry was commenced. Nothing further towards complete privatisation has happened since, and we now have the worst of both worlds private ownership or state ownership. Because of the virtual monopoly of the present state involvement in electricity generation private industry is not prepared to invest in new generating capacity as the state controls the prices charged. Because of our unique power generation in New Zealand it can reasonably be accepted that the competitive free market electricity industry would not be the best answer to efficient low cost electricity for New Zealand consumers.

Hydro generators when surplus water was gushing over their spillways would obviously be prepared to cut prices. At that stage gas a coal could not compete

We presently have the worst of both worlds.

The need for an independent inquiry is urgent. It must be set up quickly and must be require to report back early.

We need to act quickly

Issues that need to be looked at.

Where will more electricity be needed?

Where and by what means should that electricity be generated?

Should government own any or all generating stations or should all generation be privatized?

During the earlier 1005-06 consultation process Transpower admitted that New Zealand has a generation problem not a transmission problem.

Other Issues:

I am reliably informed that there are other transmission lines in the Auckland region liable to fail for lack of a maintenance and renewal plans, giving blackouts to Auckland similar to those of a few years ago.

I wish to be heard in support of my submission.

Colin W.Bull

ENDS

No virus found in this outgoing message.

Checked by AVG Free Edition.

Version: 7.5.488 / Virus Database: 269.13.37/1042 - Release Date: 10/1/2007 6:59 PM