

CAUCUS STATEMENT: SALLY PEAKE AND GAVIN LISTER

This caucus statement is restricted to the northern part of the Wind Farm (Wind Turbine Groups A, C, D), the area relating to Ms Peake's brief. The statement seeks to correct any factual errors, clarify ambiguity, and summarise the areas of agreement and disagreement of interpretation and opinion.

| <i>Topic</i> | <i>Clarification</i> | <i>Agree</i> | <i>Disagree</i> |
|---|----------------------|--|--|
| Landscape Amenity Effects | | | |
| Landscape Appraisal/Classification | | There are no outstanding natural features or landscapes in the area. | <p>Lister: The following landscapes or features (within the area from Limestone Downs to Sunset Farm) warrant recognition for their special landscape amenity:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Waikawau Valley (including road corridor). • Waikawau beach and coast • Te Tehe hill and coast (and including Waikato Heads) • Umukaraka Valley <p>Peake: Agrees with the above but also that the landscape as a whole from Limestone Downs to Te Tehe warrants recognition as a special landscape amenity area.</p> |
| Acceptability of Wind Farms in relation to 'Special Amenity Landscapes' | | | <p>Lister: Wind turbines will be visible as backdrops from these areas, but are acceptable because they are located in a manner or at a distance such that they will not compromise the values of the features or landscapes.</p> <p>Peake: Wind turbines within or visible from</p> |

| Topic | Clarification | Agree | Disagree |
|---|--|---|--|
| | | | landscapes/features of special amenity will not maintain or enhance amenity values (<i>paragraph 29</i>). No turbines should be located within special landscape amenity areas. |
| Scale of Wind Turbines in relation to Landscape | | Peake and Lister agree that landscape scale comprises both horizontal and vertical dimensions. | <p>Lister: The landscape has an expansive scale that can accommodate the wind turbines. (<i>paragraph 79 (c) evidence and paragraphs 19 & 20 rebuttal</i>)</p> <p>Peake: Agrees that parts of the Wind Farm area have an expansive scale but that the wind turbines will be out of scale with landscape in the vicinity of Sunset Farms taking into account the topography and elevation of the hills (<i>paragraph 64</i>).</p> |
| Experience from Port Waikato Waikaretu Road | The 'gateway experience' referred to by Peake (<i>paragraphs 76 & 84</i>) describes the section of road between Port Waikato and Limestone Downs (approximately 12km). | <p>Peake and Lister agree the Wind Farm will not be visible from valley south of Port Waikato until the ridge at entrance to Sunset Farms (approximately 4km south of Port Waikato) from where there will be panoramic view of Groups A and D wind turbines, and to a lesser extent Group C turbines.</p> <p>There will be views of Group A and D turbines from the hill above the Waikawau Valley.</p> <p>There will be panoramic views of the Wind Farm from the ridge south of the</p> | <p>Peake: The Wind Farm will adversely affect the experience from the road (<i>paragraph 76</i>).</p> <p>Lister: The Wind Farm will be a landmark and defining element of the landscape experienced from the road, and amenity effects will include both positive and adverse aspects (<i>paragraph 94 evidence in chief</i>). The effects will be acceptable for the reasons set out in evidence (<i>paragraphs 78-83 & 94 evidence in chief</i>)</p> |

| Topic | Clarification | Agree | Disagree |
|---|---|--|---|
| | | <p>entrance to Limestone Downs.</p> <p>From other places there will be glimpses of turbines as one travels through the valley between Sunset Farms and Limestone Downs.</p> | |
| Visual Effects from Houses on Sunset Farms | Lister's evidence and appendix had errors in house numbering, which were corrected in rebuttal (paragraph 24 rebuttal). | <p>Peake and Lister agree there will be significant visual amenity effects from the three houses.</p> <p>Peake and Lister both adopt the same 5 point scale to describe the degree of prominence and effect: very low, low, moderate, high, very high.</p> | <p>Peake: Assesses the degree of effects as 'high' from the three houses.¹ (paragraphs 77-82)</p> <p>Lister: Assesses the degree of effects as 'high from one house (N049) and 'moderate' from the other two houses (N046, N047).</p> |
| Recommendation in relation to visual effects | | | <p>Peake: All Group A turbines and turbines D001-D008 should be removed in order to avoid visual amenity effects from the houses and effects on the special landscape amenity area (paragraph 9).</p> <p>Lister: Any wind farm will have some visual amenity effects from houses. The effects are acceptable taking into account the low number of affected properties, the degree of effects, and the opportunity in some instances to provide mitigation.</p> |
| Natural Character of Coastal Environment | | | |

¹ In paragraph 80 Peake assesses the degree of effect on the owners' house (N047) as 'significant adverse'. Her rating on the five point scale is "high".
 Joint Statement of Landscape Architecture Witnesses: Sally Peake and Gavin Lister Final 16 April

| <i>Topic</i> | <i>Clarification</i> | <i>Agree</i> | <i>Disagree</i> |
|--|----------------------|---|---|
| Extent of coastal environment | | | <p>Peake: Extends inland to peaks at approximately the 200m contour (approximately 5km inland) where views of the sea are available.²</p> <p>Lister: Extends inland to ridge immediately west of Port Waikato Waikaretu Road (approximately 1.5km-2.5km from coast) (<i>paragraph 142 evidence in chief</i>).</p> <p>“Tasman Coast Management Area” in proposed Plan Change 14 to FDP follows Lister’s Zone B, more or less, approximately 400m-700m from coast (<i>paragraph 78 rebuttal evidence</i>).</p> |
| Degree of natural character | | <p>Peake and Lister both adopt the same five point scale (low, low-moderate, moderate, moderate-high, high).</p> <p>Peake and Lister agree on the degree of natural character as set out in Appendix F of Lister’s evidence in chief.</p> | |
| Effect of Wind Farm on natural character of coastal environment. | | | <p>Peake: Agrees that parts of the windfarm are an appropriate use in the coastal environment in terms of s6(a) of the RMA but some turbines do not preserve the natural character of the coastal environment, and some turbines should be reviewed with a view to relocation or removal. (<i>paragraph 72</i>).</p> |

² This refinement supersedes the evidence in paragraph 19
Joint Statement of Landscape Architecture Witnesses: Sally Peake and Gavin Lister Final 16 April

| <i>Topic</i> | <i>Clarification</i> | <i>Agree</i> | <i>Disagree</i> |
|--------------|----------------------|--------------|--|
| | | | Lister: Wind Farm detracts from mainly visual aspects of natural character, but it can be considered appropriate taking into account several landscape factors summarised in paragraph 153 of his evidence in chief. |