



Ministry for the  
**Environment**  
*Manatū Mō Te Taiao*

# **REVIEW OF CLIMATE CHANGE POLICIES**

RELEASED UNDER THE  
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

**2 November 2005**

## Foreword

This *Review of New Zealand's Climate Change Policies* was conducted by a cross-departmental team involving representatives from the Treasury, Ministry for Economic Development, Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Ministry of Transport and the Ministry for the Environment. The Review was commissioned by Cabinet and the review team assembled by the Ministry for the Environment.

When the Government announced its climate change policy package in 2002, it was noted at the time that it would be important to regularly review the progress of the policy package and to continue to monitor innovative policy measures in other jurisdictions in order to assess how these could be of relevance to New Zealand.

The policy package required officials to provide annual reports that set out progress with existing policy and stated that more comprehensive reviews may be needed in 2005, 2007 and 2010.

1. In June 2005, following revised projections of New Zealand's greenhouse gas emissions during the Kyoto Protocol's first commitment period (2008-2012), a full review was commissioned by Cabinet.
2. Cabinet instructed representatives from a range of government departments to conduct a fundamental review of New Zealand's core objectives and policy approach. The resulting paper, with proposals for additional policy responses, was completed on 2 November and presented to the Minister Responsible for Climate Change Issues on 9 November 2005.
3. The Terms of Reference for the Review were wide-ranging, and sought advice on long-term options for climate change policy in New Zealand, as well as recommendations on how New Zealand should approach the more challenging task of meeting New Zealand's commitments under the Kyoto Protocol.
4. The Review is now informing the Government as it seeks to improve New Zealand's climate change policy to ensure we are able to address perhaps the most important environmental issue the world faces.

# Contents

---

<b>Contents</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Background to the review</b> .....	<b>8</b>
1.1 The challenge of climate change and New Zealand .....	8
1.2 The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change .....	8
1.3 The Kyoto Protocol .....	8
1.4 The policy response .....	10
1.5 Review of Climate Change Policies – background and scope.....	10
1.5.1 Background .....	10
1.5.2 Objectives of the review .....	11
1.5.3 Scope of the review .....	11
1.6 Approach to the review.....	12
<b>2 International context</b> .....	<b>14</b>
2.1 International framework and institutions .....	14
2.1.1 The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).....	14
2.1.2 New Zealand obligations under the Convention.....	16
2.1.3 The Kyoto Protocol.....	17
2.1.4 New Zealand obligations under the Protocol.....	17
2.1.5 International plurilateral and bilateral agreements .....	18
2.1.6 The role of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change .....	19
2.2 Emissions trends and mitigation responses in selected countries .....	23
2.2.1 New Zealand's unique set of challenges.....	23
2.2.2 Annex I countries.....	25
2.2.3 Assessment.....	39
2.2.4 Non-Annex I countries.....	40
2.3 The future: Possible post-2012 frameworks and implications for New Zealand.....	51
2.3.1 Possible post-2012 frameworks .....	52
2.3.2 Possible post-2012 frameworks: issues for New Zealand.....	54
2.3.3 Conclusion .....	57
<b>3 New Zealand domestic context</b> .....	<b>58</b>
3.1 New Zealand's emissions profile and the economy .....	58

3.1.1	New Zealand's unique emissions profile .....	59
3.1.2	Emissions trends since 1990.....	63
3.1.3	Energy and economic growth in New Zealand.....	65
3.1.4	Greenhouse gas emissions and economic growth.....	71
3.2	New Zealand's current climate change policy settings – background .....	74
3.2.1	Current New Zealand climate change policy objectives and expected outcomes .....	75
3.2.2	<i>Price-based instruments – carbon tax and NGAs</i> .....	80
3.2.3	<i>Energy policy</i> .....	82
3.2.4	<i>Forestry and land-use change</i> .....	85
3.2.5	Agricultural non-CO <sub>2</sub> emissions .....	91
3.2.6	Transport.....	92
3.2.7	Foundation and other non-price policies .....	97
<b>4</b>	<b>Policy choices</b> .....	<b>100</b>
4.1	Overall Mitigation Prospects.....	100
4.1.1	“Decoupling” emissions and growth – what are the prospects of reducing emissions (or slowing their growth) without reducing output? .....	100
4.1.2	Energy.....	110
4.1.3	Emissions from transport.....	122
4.1.4	Non-energy emissions from agriculture.....	136
4.1.5	Forestry and land-use change.....	140
4.1.6	Linkages between mitigation and adaptation .....	143
4.2	Price-based measures.....	146
4.2.1	Context – international and domestic.....	146
4.2.2	Assessment of current carbon tax and NGAs .....	155
4.2.3	Alternatives – a modified carbon tax .....	174
4.2.4	Alternatives – a New Zealand emissions trading scheme.....	202
4.2.5	PRE – assessment and future role.....	218
	<b>Eligibility criteria</b> .....	<b>219</b>
4.3	Non-price and supplementary price measures .....	224

4.3.1	The role of non-price measures .....	225
4.3.2	Public awareness about climate change .....	227
4.3.3	Motivation and information about behaviour changes that lead to reduced greenhouse gas emissions.....	230
4.3.4	Research and development .....	231
4.3.5	Technology uptake .....	249
4.3.6	Business opportunities .....	254
4.3.7	Local government programme and waste sector .....	257
4.3.8	Synthetic gases .....	261
4.3.9	The role of Government leadership.....	263
4.4	Energy (non-transport) .....	266
4.4.1	Current policy settings (including NEECS where relevant) .....	267
4.4.2	Options – price-based measures .....	268
4.4.3	Options – non-price-based measures .....	268
4.4.4	Assessment – non-price-based measures .....	276
4.4.5	Overall conclusions .....	291
4.5	Transport sector .....	294
4.5.1	Framework for policy consideration.....	295
4.5.2	Current Government policies – likely impacts on CO <sub>2</sub> emissions....	297
4.5.3	Options for further policy .....	301
4.5.4	Conclusions.....	315
4.6	Land-use change and forestry .....	319
4.6.1	Current policies and broader context - recap .....	320
4.6.2	Incidence of liabilities – who should have property rights over forest sinks? .....	321
4.6.3	Managing future liabilities.....	322
4.6.4	The role of non-climate policies in a sustainable forestry framework.....	323
4.6.5	Policy criteria.....	323
4.6.6	Assessment of existing policy .....	324
4.6.7	Options.....	325

4.6.8	Assessment of options .....	329
4.6.9	Summary and conclusions .....	332
4.7	Non-energy emissions from agriculture .....	338
4.7.1	Current policy settings, trends and projected liabilities .....	338
4.7.2	Assessment of current policy package.....	341
4.7.3	Overview of additional policy options .....	342
4.7.4	Assessment of emissions tax and/or regulatory measures .....	343
4.7.5	Research, extension services and voluntary approaches .....	355
4.7.6	<b>[withheld under OIA s6(a), s9(2)(g)(i), s9(2)(j)]</b>	
4.7.7	Other considerations .....	367
4.7.8	Conclusions and recommendations .....	372
4.8	Moving towards a purchasing strategy .....	376
	The flexibility mechanisms .....	377
4.8.1	Possible objective guiding a purchasing strategy.....	377
4.8.2	Factors impinging on the supply and demand for units.....	378
4.8.3	Factors impinging on a purchasing strategy.....	379
4.8.4	Purchasing options.....	380
4.8.5	The price of carbon .....	380
4.8.6	Conclusions.....	381
4.9	Alternative approaches to meeting New Zealand's commitments in CP1.....	381
4.9.1	Introduction .....	382
4.9.2	Modelled scenarios of New Zealand greenhouse emissions paths.....	382
4.9.3	Key results from the ABARE model runs .....	383
4.9.4	Discussion of the modelling results .....	386
4.9.5	Conclusions.....	387
<b>5</b>	<b>New Zealand's strategic climate change goal .....</b>	<b>389</b>
5.1	Towards a downwards carbon path? .....	389
5.2	Choosing strategic climate change objectives .....	390
5.3	Considerations in developing a goal.....	391
5.3.1	Key considerations .....	391

5.3.2	Considerations for New Zealand in post-2012 emissions targets ...	392
5.3.3	Technology standards and production efficiencies .....	393
5.3.4	Conclusion .....	393
<b>6</b>	<b>International setting, New Zealand position and strategy for UNFCCC COP11.....</b>	<b>395</b>
6.1	International setting .....	395
6.1.1	Introduction .....	395
6.1.2	Summary of key player positions .....	395
6.1.3	Possible approaches to international action.....	398
6.1.4	Implications for New Zealand.....	401
6.2	New Zealand position and strategy .....	401
6.2.1	New Zealand's position to date .....	401
	<b>[withheld under OIA s6(a), s9(2)(d), s9(2)(j), s9(2)(g)(i)]</b>	
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusions.....</b>	<b>409</b>
7.1	Introduction.....	409
7.2	New Zealand's Strategic Climate Change Goals.....	410
7.2.1	Preface.....	410
7.2.2	Where did the Government aim in 2002?.....	410
7.2.3	What has changed since 2002?.....	412
7.2.4	Consideration of Alternative Strategic Climate Change Objectives.....	413
7.2.5	An alternative Climate Change Goal could be established based around the principles of "international engagement" and "policy sustainability" .....	414
7.3	Policy Choice - Price-Based Mechanisms (PBMs), Regulation and Support Policies.....	414
7.4	Carbon Taxes and Emissions Trading.....	416
7.4.1	Assessment of the Carbon Tax as Announced by the Government.....	416
7.4.2	Alternative Carbon Tax Options .....	416
7.4.3	A New Zealand Emissions Trading Scheme .....	419
7.4.4	Projects to Reduce Emissions (PRE).....	420

7.5	Sectoral Analysis .....	421
7.5.1	Agriculture .....	421
7.5.2	Energy .....	425
7.5.3	Forestry and Land use change.....	427
7.5.4	Transport.....	429
7.6	Meeting our Kyoto Obligations in CP1 – the Broad Choices .....	431
7.7	Prospects for Reducing New Zealand’s Domestic Emissions in CP1.....	432
7.7.1	Opportunities to Reduce New Zealand’s net emissions in CP1 .....	432
7.8	A Strategy for Purchasing Kyoto units using the Kyoto “Flexible Mechanisms” .....	433
7.9	International Engagement .....	433
<b>References .....</b>		<b>437</b>
<b>Annexes.....</b>		<b>453</b>
	Annex 1: Background on forestry and rules .....	453
	Annex 2: The role of non-climate policies in a sustainable forestry framework.....	461
	Annex 3: Policy criteria .....	465
	Annex 4: The European Union Emissions Trading Scheme .....	467
	Annex 5: Computable General Equilibrium Model .....	469
<b>GLOSSARY OF TERMS.....</b>		<b>471</b>

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

RELEASED UNDER THE  
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT